#### FINAL

# Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 1993 Otay Ranch GDP/SRP PEIR Mitigation Monitoring Program Compliance

Prepared for:

County of San Diego

5510 Overland Avenue

San Diego, California 92123

Contact: Greg Mattson

**SEPTEMBER 2018** 

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	LAND USE, PLANNING, AND ZONING			
	Significant Effect: Potential incompatibility with existing adjacent land uses, including Otay Landfill, EastLake, San Diego Air Sports Center, and the		2, p. 4.9.2-1]	
1	1a. The SPA Plans developed for the areas of the Otay River parcel adjacent to East Lake, industrially designated lands in the City of Chula Vista, the Otay Landfill, the Nelson and Sloan quarry site, the Rock Mountain quarry and the Daley quarry shall contain landscaping, grading, and buffering standards (including any standards contained in Sections 3.13, 3.14, and 3.16 of the Final Program EIR) designed to prevent land use interface impacts such as health hazards, noise, lighting, and loss of privacy between Otay Ranch and these adjacent land uses. The SPA plan shall be reviewed by the city or county planning department that has jurisdiction over these areas to ensure that standards avoid significant interface impacts from occurring. In the case of the Otay Landfill, which is scheduled to close in 1999, alternate mitigation would require phasing the development of adjacent residences so that this part of the parcel is not developed until after the landfill has been closed.	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project is not within the Otay Valley Parcel or adjacent to any of the land uses listed in the Mitigation Measure.
2	The Project plans shall be submitted to the Federal Aviation Administration (FAA) for review as soon as possible to determine whether or not land use incompatibilities exist between the Project and the existing San Diego Air Sports Center. If it is determined by the FAA that such incompatibilities exist, then the SPA plan shall be designed to avoid such interface impacts. The Project Applicant shall then revise the Project's phasing plan to allow for use of the sports center until its option expires.	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project does not impact San Diego Air Sports Center. Further, EIR Section 3.1.1, Hazards, analyzes the Proposed Project impacts due to Airport Hazards (Section 3.1.1.2.3) and determined such impacts were Less than Significant.
3	Development proposed adjacent to the Daley quarry, the Nelson and Sloan quarry and the Rock Mountain quarry in the San Ysidro parcel shall occur in accordance with the following mitigation measures:  Residential development within 9300 feet of the quarries shall be staged such that construction shall not take place unless the quarries have been mined-out and mining operations have ceased or noise impacts can be mitigated as demonstrated in the site-specific noise study to an exterior noise level of 60 CNEL or below and an interior noise level of 45 CNEL or below for residences.  A site-specific noise study shall be required to determine the specific noise impacts and measures necessary to achieve an exterior noise level of 60 CNEL or below and an interior noise level of 45 CNEL or below. The study shall be prepared by a qualified acoustician in accordance with local noise standards	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project is not adjacent to or within 9,300 feet of the referenced quarries.
	Significant Effect: Potential incompatibility with internal Project land uses including residential, commercial, and industrial uses. [FPEIR, Volume 2]	2, p. 4.9.2-1]		
4	The SPA plans developed for the above mentioned areas of the Project site shall contain policy language that explicitly sets forth standards for landscaping, grading, and buffering to prevent land use interface impacts such as noise, lighting, and loss of privacy from occurring between adjacent internal land uses, especially between single-family and multi-family residential land uses and between residential and non-residential land uses (including the standards contained in 3.13, 3.14 and 3.16 of the Final Program EIR).  Lots contiguous to Jamul in the Proctor Valley parcel may not be smaller than one acre in size.	Applicable	Satisfied: Otay Ranch Policies referenced are included in the Specific Plan, Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines including landscape, grading and buffer policies. See also the GPAR plan consistency analysis prepared as Appendix 3.1.3-1 to the Project Level EIR. Also see grading plan/site design. These have been reviewed by the County.	There are no interface issues between single family or residential land uses and non-residential land uses, as neighborhood-serving commercial/retail uses are separated from residential land uses by internal roadways. Further, there are no multi-family residential land uses within the Proposed Project. If the school site is not needed and is converted to residential, there would be no interface issues for the school site.  The size of lots with Planning Area 19 were reduced due to environmental constraints which resulted in additional open space and one-acre average sized lots within Planning Area 19. The number of lots within Planning Area 19 did not change. Lots within Planning Area 16 are one-acre or larger.
	All SPA plans shall be reviewed by the city or county planning department that has jurisdiction over the area in which the proposed SPA plan is located to ensure that proposed standards are adequate to prevent significant interface impacts from occurring.			The County of San Diego has reviewed the Specific Plan and prepared the Project-level EIR which determined that such interface impacts would be less than significant. Refer to EIR, Section 3.1.3, Land Use and Planning.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
5	Buffer and/or transition techniques which deal with the transition between different "villages" within and outside of the Project are included in the land use policies of the Project's GDP	Applicable	Satisfied: The Otay Ranch GDP/SRP land use plan establishes village and planning area boundaries and are consistent with the Specific Plan.	The Proposed Project conforms to the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP development footprint and land uses. Refer to EIR, Section 3.1.3, Land Use and Planning, and General Plan Amendment Report (EIR Appendix 3.1.3-1).
6	If the existing FAA VORTAC facility is not relocated, the Subregional Plan map shall be revised to indicate this existing land use. In addition, the SPA plan developed for this area shall set forth standards for landscaping, grading, and buffering guidelines to prevent land use interface impacts. The SPA plan shall be reviewed by the city or county planning department that has jurisdiction over this area to ensure that proposed guidelines are adequate to prevent significant interface impacts from occurring.	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project is not near the existing FAA VORTAC located within the Otay Valley Parcel.
7	The Applicant shall implement the development criteria in the RMP to protect resources located outside the management preserve	Applicable	Satisfied: The Specific Plan design is consistent with the development criteria in RMP. The RMP includes measures to address indirect effects. These have been reviewed by the County.	The RMP and MSCP adjacencies' requirements are implemented in the Proposed Project, as documented in the EIR, Section 2.4, Biological Resources, including the mitigation measures contained in Section 2.4.6, as well as the Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1), and the Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 1).
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Potential land use incompatibilities between Otay Ranch and the alternate county landfill sites. [FPEIR, Vo			
8	The SPA plans developed for the areas of the Otay River parcel adjacent to any of the alternate San Diego County landfill sites shall contain landscaping and buffering standards designed to prevent land use interface impacts such as health hazards, noise, lighting, and loss of privacy between Otay Ranch and these adjacent land uses. The SPA plans shall be reviewed by the City of Chula Vista City Council and the County of San Diego Board of Supervisors to ensure that proposed standards are adequate to prevent significant interface impacts from occurring LANDFORM ALTERATION/AESTHETICS	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project is not within the Otay Valley Parcel.
	Significant Effect: Alteration of significant or sensitive landforms. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p.4.9.3-1]			
9	The GDP/Subregional Plan developed for the Otay Ranch Project contains specific landform alteration standards that provide stringent protection	Provisions related to the use	Satisfied: Landform alteration	
3	of sensitive landforms. The Applicant shall implement, at a minimum, the following mitigation measures in addition to those described in the GDP/SRP:	of variable slope ratios and steep slope preservation are applicable	standards are implemented in the Specific Plan, Grading Plan and Tentative Map design which have been reviewed by the County.	See Specific Plan, TM and Grading Plan. See EIR Section 2.1, Aesthetics, for visual simulations prepared for the Proposed Project.
	Roadways shall be designed to follow the natural contours of hillsides and minimize visibility of road cuts and manufactured slopes.			Proctor Valley Road improvements are designed to follow the existing alignment and topography of existing Proctor Valley Road to the extent feasible to minimize grading impacts and manufactured slopes associated with the road. See EIR Section 2.1.2.2, Aesthetics, Visual Character or Quality. Although the project would realign a small segment of Proctor Valley Road to prevent/reduce impacts to biological resources, the realignment would not increase visual impacts of the road.
	Excessive use of manufactured slopes in the Otay River Valley, Jamul and San Ysidro Mountains, and the area around Otay Lakes shall not be permitted.			Manufactured slopes have been minimized to the greatest extent feasible.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Natural buffering (e.g., undeveloped open space) shall be provided between development and significant landforms, including the Jamul and San Ysidro Mountains.	Project	Method	The Proposed Project is surrounded by natural open space designated as RMP Preserve. In addition, a 100' Preserve Edge buffer is located within the Development Footprint at the perimeter.
	Variable slope ratios not exceeding 2: 1 shall be utilized when developing grading plans.			Variable slope ratios are utilized to soften grades and blend into natural open space areas., as shown on the Grading Plan.
	Eighty-three percent of the steep slopes (steeper than 25 %) shall be preserved.			The Ranch-wide 83% steep slope preservation standard is met as analyzed in EIR, Section 1, Project Description, Location and Environmental Setting, Table 1-4, Otay Ranch Steep Slopes.
10	<ul> <li>Grading to correct mining disturbance shall be limited to:</li> <li>Clearing previously disturbed areas and minor areas incidental to the previously disturbed areas.</li> <li>Capping of areas to provide ground for establishing new plant material or construction of approved uses, (i.e., staging areas, recreation centers, interpretive centers, etc.).</li> <li>Overexcavation of areas for recompaction, creation of habitat and creation of wetland areas.</li> <li>Grading to create flood control devices including overexcavation and creation of berms to contain floods.</li> <li>All grading shall result in new landforms which emulate existing landforms found within the river valley as of Project approval. These new features shall include irregular slopes of variable pitch.</li> </ul>	Not Applicable		No mining has occurred within the Project Site. See EIR, Section 3.1.4, Mineral Resources.
11	All grading plans submitted for the Otay Ranch property shall be prepared by a certified engineer and evaluated by the planning and engineering departments of the appropriate jurisdiction. Development shall be constructed in accordance with those plans as well as the grading policies of the GDP/Subregional Plan.	Applicable	Satisfied: Grading Plan and Tentative Map design were by Hunsaker engineering and reviewed and by the County with TM Conditions of Approval generated by staff to assure construction in accordance with plans and policies.	A Grading Plan and Tentative Map were prepared for the Proposed Project by Hunsaker and Associates, a certified civil engineer. The Grading Plan is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP grading policies and have been reviewed by the County Planning & Development Services Department. See EIR, Section 2.1, Aesthetics.
	Significant Effect: Development in highly visible areas. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.3-1]			
12	The GDP/SRP contains a requirement that at the Specific Plan level, after the receipt of more specific development plans, specific mitigation measures to reduce grading and visual resource impacts of the resort, residential, commercial, industrial, and public/civic land uses and the associated roadways must be developed. Future analysis shall include either engineering cross-sections depicting existing and proposed topography or photo documentation illustrating proposed topographic and design features. Any cut and fill slopes in excess of 15 feet in height shall be identified. Special attention shall be placed on grading and design of the following, highly visible, features of the Project:	Applicable except for specific measures related to Village 13 (resort) and the San Ysidro Parcel.	Satisfied: The Grading Plan and Tentative Map design incorporated measures to reduce grading. The TM has Conditions of Approval. These have been reviewed by the County.	The Grading Plan and Tentative Map are being processed concurrently with the Specific Plan and have been designed to reduce visual and grading impacts to the greatest extent practicable. Grading Plans show cut/fill slopes in excess of 15 feet in height. See EIR, Section 2.1, Photo simulations and analysis prepared for the Proposed Project is included in the EIR Section 2.1 Aesthetics.
	Size, location, and setbacks of the resort building above Lower Otay Lake.			Not Applicable. This Measure applies to Village 13.
	Grading and development of residential areas within the San Ysidro parcel in the higher elevations in the vicinity of Lower Otay Lake.			Not Applicable. This Measure applies to San Ysidro Parcel.
	Height and length of manufactured slopes along Telegraph Canyon Road, Otay Lakes Road, Proctor Valley Road, and Otay Valley Road.			Proctor Valley Road improvements are designed to follow the existing alignment and topography to the extent feasible to minimize grading impacts and manufactured slopes associated with the road. See EIR Section 2.1. Aesthetics. A realignment is proposed to avoid sensitive habitat.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Development and grading along major ridgelines, such as within the San Ysidro and Jamul mountain areas, and adjacent to all-natural open space areas.			The Grading Plan has been designed to minimize grading within higher elevations of the Project Site.
	Location and visibility of new public trails through open space in proximity to existing and future development			Public Trails are addressed on the Tentative Map within the Specific Plan. The Project is clustered to the extent feasible for compliance with the GDP/SRP approved densities.
	Placement of clustered development or stepped (split-level) building pads in hillside regions, if possible, to minimize landscape disturbance and retain ridgelines			Split-level building pads are not recommended by the Geotechical Engineer. Per the Geotechnical Report (EIR Appendix 2.6-1) prepared for the Tentative Map, split lots present significant challenges from a geotechnical and structural engineering perspective, particularly as it relates to differential settlement/movement and drainage. The Geotechnical Report recommends that structures uniformly bear on the same material across entire structural footprint to help minimize distress related to differential settlement/movement.
13	The GDP/SRP contains binding design guidelines that will pertain to future streetscapes, buildings, and villages to enhance the visual appeal of development and prevent contrasts in site character. The design guidelines, which are binding on the applicant, include the following:	Applicable	Satisfied: The Grading Plan and Tentative Map design, Specific Plan, Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines contain the referenced binding design guidelines and have	The Proposed Project implements the Otay Ranch GPD/SRP design guidelines. See Specific Plan, Village Design Plan (Specific Plan Appendix 5) and Design Guidelines (Specific Plan Appendix 7).
	View corridors shall be integrated at the terminus or periodically along the length of streets paralleling or intersecting undeveloped open space.		been reviewed by the County.	<ul> <li>View corridors are created at the ends of cul-de- sacs, along single-loaded residential streets and at private pocket parks within single family neighborhoods.</li> </ul>
	Walls, including acoustical barriers, shall be integrated into the architectural theme and scale of the villages.			The Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines include a Fence & Wall Plan and wall and fence details, consistent with the Proposed Project's
	Landscape themes shall be used to define village character and blend with adjacent existing development.			<ul> <li>The Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines establish the landscape theme for the Proposed</li> </ul>
	Natural and native plantings shall be integrated into revegetation plans for manufactured slopes adjacent to open space areas.			Project, consistent with the Old California theme.  The landscape theme along existing Proctor Valley Road within Chula Vista continues through the Proposed Project. Naturalized planting will be utilized within the Proposed Project perimeter manufactured slopes and the 100' Preserve Edge consistent with the surrounding natural open space areas. The plant
	Scale and architectural treatments (i.e., rooflines, building materials) of all residential and non-residential village buildings shall be diverse and yet compatible.			pallete is natural and has been reviewed by the County.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Signage shall be controlled and designed to fit m the pedestrian environment.	,		The Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines provide the architectural guidelines for the Project, including scale, rooflines and architectural styles/forms which are diverse and compatible.
	Buffer techniques shall be developed to address transitions between villages and incompatible land uses to minimize visual impacts.			The Specific Plan Development Regulations provide signage requirements for the Proposed Project
	Architectural colors for development adjacent to open space areas shall incorporate natural tones and shades.			The GDP/SRP land plan provides buffers between villages and planning areas. Internal landscape buffers in the form of slopes and parkways provide internal buffers.
	Overhead and night lighting shall be developed in accordance with the County's Dark Sky ordinance in the Proctor Valley and San Ysidro parcels. Street fixtures shall utilize low glare bulbs (i.e., amber light) and be placed, only as necessary, near key intersections for security purposes in accordance with the county policy.			The Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines establish the natural tones and shades for buildings within the Proposed Project.
				The Village Design Plan and Design Guidelines require compliance with the County's Dark Sky ordinance (County of San Diego Code of Regulatory Ordinance, Section 51.201-51.209, Light Pollution Code) and provide lighting plans, fixture designs and shielding requirements for the Proposed Project.
14	SPA plans and all implementing documents shall require design review for all building and site plans to ensure compatible architectural styles, building materials, building proportions, landscaping, streetscape, and signage throughout each village.	Applicable	Satisfied: Specific Plan, Village Design Plan, Specific Plan, Appendix 5 and Design Guidelines, Specific Plan, Appendix 7 contain the reference requirements and have been reviewed by the County.	The Specific Plan. Chapter IV. Development Regulations, provide the Site Planning Procedure, including Site Plan requirements and review process, consistent with County regulations, which includes determining consistency with applicable design guidelines.
15	To mitigate impacts on visual resources associated with the resort, to be located on the mesa north of Lower Otay Lake, and all other development surrounding the eastern and southern sides of the lake, site plan and building schematics shall be reviewed by the appropriate jurisdiction to ensure the following measures are incorporated into the design:  Buildings shall be visually compatible in terms of height, scale, and bulk and shall be set back from the edge of the mesa and composed of low-rise structures, no more than three stories in height with an occasional four-story building.	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project is not located east or south of Lower Otay Lake. This measure applies to Village 13.
	Contour grading shall be used to transition graded slopes into the natural topography of surrounding hillsides.			
	Manufactured slopes shall be revegetated upon completion of grading activities.			
	Color schemes shall be limited to natural colors that blend with the existing environment and surrounding hillsides.			
	Buildings shall maximize the use of non-reflective/ non-glare surfaces.			

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
40	Significant Cumulative Effect: The cumulative effects of night lighting. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-13]	T A 12 1.1	0 ( 5 10 ) ( 5)	TT D
16	Compliance with the San Diego County Code Sections 59.101-115 (the County Dark Sky Ordinance). Compliance will be required even if an SPA is being developed under the jurisdiction of the City of Chula Vista.  BIOLOGICAL RESOURCES	Applicable	Satisfied. Specific Plan, Chapter IV, Design Guidelines, Village Design Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 5) and Development Regulations (Specific Plan, Appendix 7) demonstrate compliance with the Dark Sky Ordinance requirement. These have been reviewed by the County.	The Proposed Project will conform to the County's Dark Sky Ordinance. See Draft EIR Section 2.1, Aesthetics, subsection 2.1.2.3, Light and Glare, which determined the Proposed Project would comply with the provisions of the Dark Sky Ordinance.
4	The SRP incorporates the policies and standards of the project's RMP and includes an open space system as called for in the RMP. The Specific	Applicable	Achieved by Project Level EIR and	The Proposed Project design as set forth in the Specific
	Plans will need to be consistent with the RMP.		RMP Regulatory Compliance. The Specific Plan/Project design also incorporates the RMP. May also be achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR. These have been reviewed by the County.	Plan is consistent with the RMP and would implement the measures contained therein. There are no changes to the RMP Preserve or LDA footprint. Additional Conserved Open Space contributes to conservation over and above the RMP. Moreover, the Proposed Project must comply with all applicable RMP conditions and standards as regulatory compliance. (M-BI-3, M-BI-4, M-BI-11)
3	Specific mitigation regarding on-site preservation standards, additional sensitive resource studies, control of water runoff, implementation of a Fire Management Plan, and habitat restoration are listed in Exhibit B of this program. Applicable Specific Plans shall meet the required	Applicable	Achieved by Project Level EIR and Regulatory Compliance. May also be	The Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch
	preservation standards and include the required studies and plans, as well as detailed restoration plans, maintenance and monitoring programs, where necessary.		achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR. With respect to Exhibit B Compliance See #17 to #131 below.	GDP/SRP and RMP development footprint. Since its approval in 1993, several changes to the RMP Preserve have occurred, including the acquisition of developable portions of Otay Ranch for conservation purposes in Village 15, Village 14 (inverted L) and Village 14/Planning Area 16 State acquisition, which will contribute to preservation above the original Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint. Revisions to the RMP Preserve footprint in Chula Vista have been processed in accordance with the RMP requirements for boundary adjustments/amendments to provide for equivalent or superior RMP Preserve. Project level EIR Section 2.4 and Appendix 2.4-1 include project-specific mitigation measures (M-BI-1 through M-BI-21). The Project is required to comply with the RMP Policies and Guidelines including the Otay Ranch Preserve Conveyance requirement and any species-specific mitigation requirements. See below regarding the Proposed Project's compliance with restoration requirements specific to the County of San Diego's Biological Mitigation Ordinance (BMO) and RMP requirements. RMP Policy 3.2 mandates that the RMP restoration programs be accomplished by the project applicant in coordination wit the County and the Preserve Owner/Manager (POM). The Otay Ranch POM is responsible for verification of annual restoration programs. Note also that the RMP has been incorporated into the MSCP County Subarea Plan,

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
		, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,		proposed Project demonstrates that the Project is consistent with the MSCP County Subarea Plan, including its RMP component. A Fire Protection Plan is included in the Project Level EIR as Appendix 3.1.12.
C	Specific mitigation for impacts to regional corridors and important local wildlife corridors should follow detailed recommendations of the Wildlife Corridor Study as indicated in Exhibit B of the program.	Applicable	Achieved through the preparation of the Project Level EIR and Regulatory Compliance. May also be achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR. The referenced Exhibit B Compliance is provided below in #132 to #136	The Proposed Project is consistent with the recommendations of the Ogden Wildlife Corridor Study as analyzed in Section 2.4, Biological Resources of the EIR. Upon conveyance, the POM is responsible for performing annual field checks and monitoring. (M-BI-3)  Appendix L to Appendix 2.4-1 provides a review of wildlife corridor and crossing studies which are relevant to the Proposed Project. As determined in that memo, none of the conclusions drawn in the recent studies are inconsistent with, nor do they undermine, the validity of the Ogden Wildlife Corridor Study. It has also been determined, through extensive field work and surveys for the Proposed Project, that conditions within and surrounding the Project Area have not materially changed since the Ogden Wildlife Corridor Study was prepared in 1992. Thus, the study, including its empirical findings, remains valid.
	Significant Effect: Sensitive uplands (including coastal sage scrub), wetlands, and vernal pool habitat would be impacted. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4	1.9.4-1 through 4.9.4-4]		
17	Diegan Coastal Sage Scrub  The project shall be designed to preserve 70 percent of the coastal sage scrub onsite including significant portions of CSS in the key areas including:  Salt Creek, Poggi and Wolf canyons, Rock Mountain and existing CSS on north side of Otay River Valley, Patches of CSS south of Lower Otay Lake and the San Diego Air Sports Center	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve Design consistency, regulatory compliance with the RMP conveyance requirements and MSCP standards. Measures incorporated into the project-level EIR.	This is a ranch-wide standard achieved through RMP Preserve design and preservation of Limited Development Areas. The Proposed Project is not located in any of the key areas identified by the PEIR measure. The Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and RMP development footprint. In addition, developable portions of Otay Ranch have been purchased for conservation purposes (described in line B above). Revisions to the RMP Preserve footprint in Chula Vista have been processed in accordance with the RMP requirements for boundary adjustments/amendments to provide for equivalent or superior functionality. Therefore, the cumulative changes to the RMP Preserve since certification of the Program EIR would ensure this ranchwide preservation standard is met.
18	1,300 acres of identified high priority CSS areas on the Project site shall be restored (see Figure 3.3-8 in the FPEIR). This restoration shall include a minimum of 56 acres of maritime succulent scrub. Restoration shall follow the conceptual sage scrub revegetation plan outlined in the RMP. (Section 4. 3. 1)	Not Applicable		The Coastal Sage Scrub restoration requirement was eliminated by County Board of Supervisors General Plan Amendment 06-012 and City Council Resolution 2006-155

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
19	Coastal sage scrub restoration activities shall commence prior to or concurrent with approval of the first SPA/Specific Plan within Otay Ranch and shall have achieved success, based on performance standards described below and in future detailed restoration plans, prior to or concurrent with any Project approval for development resulting in significant impacts to coastal sage scrub habitat occupied by California gnatcatchers.  The success of a specific coastal sage scrub restoration effort will be measured by its ability to replace the habitat values lost, and by its ability to support native plant and wildlife species typical of coastal sage scrub. The following are success criteria that shall be achieved:  The shrub layer within each revegetated patch will consist of at least four site-typical native shrub species found on Table 3 (p. 142 of the RMP), or 60 percent of the species determined to occur in the target patch of the preferred habitat type, whichever is greater, and the herb layer will consist of at least four native grass or herb species, or 60 percent of the native grass or herb species, whichever is greater.  The percent cover composition of the shrub and herb layers will be determined by qualitative analysis of a target patch of vegetation. The target patch may be a different sub-type of coastal sage scrub than that being disturbed; the availability of the mitigation site will determine which sub-type is most appropriate for restoration. Factors as described herein regarding current habitat quality of the to-be-disturbed site will be measured, including tolal species number, number and prevalence of exotic species, and shrub and herb density. Additionally, factors contained in Chapter 4, specifically Table 4 of the RMP, shall be achieved.  Wildlife use will be measured using birds. In a patch greater than 25 acres, there will be use by at least 80 percent of the bird species found to be present in the baseline study or five scrub-requiring bird species from the following list of resident species,	Not Applicable		See Comment #18 above.
20	Potential indirect impacts shall be mitigated by providing a minimum, 100-foot buffer area around all preserved coastal sage scrub. No development, landscaping or in wholesale clearing for fire management shall be allowed within the buffer area. Selective thinning for fire management shall be allowed within the buffer	Applicable	Satisfied. Project design incorporates the 100-foot buffer per RMP and MSCP standards. Implemented as detailed in the Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan Appendix 1). Compliance with the Preserve Edge Plan is required by the RMP.	The Proposed Project complies with the RMP requirement to prepare a Preserve Edge Plan. The Proposed Project includes a 100' Preserve edge within the Development Footprint in areas adjacent to the RMP Preserve. Fire Management activities within the 100' Preserve Edge are consistent with RMP and MSCP requirements. See the Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 1) and Fire Protection Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-2).

		<u> </u>		Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Maritime Succulent Scrub			
21	The project is designed to preserve 80 percent of the maritime succulent scrub onsite.	Not Applicable		The Otay Ranch Program EIR did not identify MSS within the Proposed Project. A Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project and confirmed that MSS does not occur within the Proposed Project site. However, achievement of the ranchwide preservation standard is realized through implementation of MSS restoration requirements within Otay Ranch, where applicable.
22	Disjunctive stands shall be protected, especially where they support cactus thickets and can logically be tied to a larger open space network.	Not Applicable		See Comment #21 above
23	A minimum of 56 acres of maritime succulent shall be restored in conjunction with the CSS restoration of 1,300 acres	Not Applicable		See Comment #21 above
	Floodplain Scrub, Southern Willow Scrub, and Aquatic/Freshwater Marsh			
24	The project is designed to retain 95 percent of the floodplain scrub, southern willow scrub, and aquatic/freshwater marsh habitats. Restoration/enhancement of disturbed wetland habitat shall occur in the Otay River Valley within tamarisk/ mulefat scrub habitat (See Figure 3.3-8 in the FPEIR) to mitigate the remaining impacts	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and regulatory compliance with the RMP conveyance requirement. Measures incorporated into the Project-level EIR.	The ranch-wide standard is achieved through RMP Preserve design. The Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and RMP development footprint. Since its approval in 1993, several changes to the RMP Preserve have occurred, including the private and public acquisition of developable portions of Otay Ranch for conservation purposes. Revisions to the RMP Preserve footprint in Chula Vista have been processed in accordance with the RMP requirements for boundary adjustments/amendments to provide for equivalent or superior RMP Preserve functionality. Therefore, the cumulative changes to the RMP Preserve since certification of the Program EIR would ensure that this ranch-wide preservation standard is met. (M-BI-3)  While mitigation for impacts to jurisdictional resources will likely occur within the Otay River Valley, the mitigation for these resources is determined by agency approval (see #25).
25	Impacts shall be avoided through placement and design features (i.e., road location and infrastructure design) and the application of ratios as defined by the appropriate public agencies. Development shall not occur until compensation has been approved by the California Department of Fish and Game through the Streambed Alteration Agreement and/or the Corps of Engineers 404 permit process, as required in accordance with their no net loss standard	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	Prior to impacts occurring to U.S. Army Corps of Engineers (ACOE) Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWQCB), and California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW) (collectively, the Resource Agencies) jurisdictional aquatic resources, the Proposed Project applicant or its designee shall obtain permits including but not limited to: ACOE 404 permit, RWQCB 401 Water Quality Certification and CDFW Fish and Game Code 1600 Streambed Alteration Agreement. (M-BI-21)
	Non-native Grassland (NNG)			
26	The provision of a large open space system with open habitats and native grasslands will substantially lessen this impact, however, not to a level below significance	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and regulatory compliance with the RMP conveyance requirement. Measures incorporated into the Project-level EIR.	The RMP Preserve would mitigate impacts on non-native grasslands by providing suitable habitat in a configuration that preserves genetic exchange and species viability. Thus, direct impacts to this non-native grassland would be reduced to less than significant.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
		•		In addition, the Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and RMP development footprint. Since its approval in 1993, several changes to the RMP Preserve have occurred for conservation purposes, including the acquisition of developable portions of Otay Ranch in Village 15, Village 14 (inverted L) and Village 14/Planning Area 16 State acquisition, which will contribute to additional foraging and restorable habitat. Revisions to the RMP Preserve footprint in Chula Vista have been processed in accordance with the RMP requirements for boundary adjustments/amendments to provide for equivalent or superior RMP Preserve functionality.
	Valley Needlegrass Grassland/Perennial Grassland (PG)	1		
27	The project is designed to preserve 25 percent of the valley needlegrass grassland	Applicable	Satisfied. Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Valley Needlegrass/Perennial Grassland does not occur within the Proposed Project. This ranch-wide standard is achieved through RMP Preserve design. The Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and RMP development footprint.
28	High priority areas for preservation and restoration shall include the disturbed perennial grassland contiguous within the K6 vernal pool complex and large San Diego thorn-mint population north of Lower Otay Lake, and in selected areas in the Otay River parcel to be determined by subsequent field transect studies	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project does not include the high priority areas identified in the measure.
29	A ratio of between 1:1 and 3: 1 (restored to impacted habitat) shall be required	Not Applicable		Valley Needlegrass/Perennial Grassland does not occur within the Proposed Project. While there are patches of native grassland within the Project Area, they did not meet the minimum mapping unit to be classified as a vegetation community.
	Alkali Meadow			
30	The project is designed to preserve 72 percent of alkali meadow	Applicable	Satisfied. Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Alkali meadow does not occur within the Project Area.  This ranch-wide standard is achieved through RMP Preserve design. The Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and RMP development footprint.
				While alkali meadow does not occur within the Project Area, there are areas mapped as cismontane alkali marsh which is a similar vegetation community. The Proposed Project avoids 87% of cismontane alkali marsh within the Project Area. See Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1).
31	Impacts shall be substantially lessened through placement and design features (i.e., road location and infrastructure design) and application of a ratio as defined by the appropriate public agency, however, no less than 1:1 based on habitat type and quality and whether pre-establishment of in-kind habitat has occurred. Development shall not occur until compensation has been approved by the California Department of Fish and Game through the Streambed Alteration Agreement and/or the Corps of Engineers 404 permit process, as required in accordance with their no net loss standard	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into the Project level EIR.	A restoration site is located in the RMP Preserve area in the northern portion of Village 14 and is avoided through project design (see RMP Figure 21). Areas with similar attributes to alkali meadow occur within the development footprint (1.1 acre) and are classified as wetlands, which would be mitigated pursuant to Resource Agency permits.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
32	Potential indirect impacts shall be mitigated by providing a minimum 100-foot width buffer area for all alkali meadow habitat. No development or landscaping shall be allowed within the buffer areas. Impacts to alkali meadow from hydrological alterations (including potential displacement of native habitat with exotic and wetland species) shall be mitigated as described herein. The water runoff from surrounding development shall be diverted and controlled to retain the same amount and seasonality of water input existing before development. A study shall be required at the Specific Plan level of analysis to determine existing hydrological conditions of streams containing alkali meadow and what hydrological changes will occur to these streams after development. The results of these studies shall be used to engineer the storm drain system to achieve pre-impact hydrological conditions.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance. implementation of the Preserve Edge Plan, Specific Plan, Appendix 1) and the Hydromodification Flow Control Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-4).	Consistent with RMP requirements, a Preserve Edge Plan was prepared for the Proposed Project. The Proposed Project includes a 100-foot preserve edge buffer at the perimeter of the Proposed Project adjacent to the RMP Preserve.  A Hydromodification Flow Control Study (EIR Appendix
				3.1.2-4) was prepared for the Proposed Project which verifies compliance with San Diego County BMP Design Manual requirements. This study analyzes the hydrological (0.1Q2- Q10 events) changes proposed with the development and compares it to the pre-impact condition. The proposed storm drain facilities are designed to achieve compliance.
	Vernal Pools			
33	The Project is designed to preserve 95 percent of large or high value vernal pool complexes and preservation of 95 percent of all other vernal pools. The vernal pool complexes on Otay Ranch that are large or of high value and which the Project preserves include J23-24, J25 on Otay Mesa and J30; K1 and K 15+ in Otay River Valley; R3 in Proctor Valley; K6, K8 and K12 are in a special study area to determine whether they should be preserved.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and avoidance.	The R3 vernal pool is location adjacent to the Proposed Project. Proctor Valley Road was designed to avoid impacts to R3. R3 will not be impacted by the Proposed Project and will remain in the RMP Preserve under CDFW management.
34	The Project is designed to preserve that portion of vernal pool J29 (including J31+) containing sensitive species, including a minimum 100-foot width buffer	Not Applicable		Vernal pools J29 and J31+ are not within the Project Area.
35	The allowed 5 percent impact to any of the lower quality vernal pool complexes shall be substantially lessened by restoration/enhancement of damaged vernal pool habitat within disturbed areas of the preserved vernal pool complexes so that no net loss of vernal pool habitat value or area occurs. Mitigation shall be consistent with the requirements of Section 404 of the Clean Water Act in accordance with their no net loss standard. Restoration shall include decompaction, sculpting and recontouring, and seeding of basins disturbed by dirt roads, trails, or scraped areas. Vernal pools shall also be enhanced through removal of exotic plant species. Reintroduction of declining vernal pool species to suitable areas for recolonization shall also be required. Impacts to vernal pool habitat shall occur only after successful completion of the restoration program. Vernal pool restoration shall achieve the following:  Restore the biota of individual, badly degraded vernal pools; Increase diversity and frequency of native biota in all disturbed vernal pools; Preserve and enhance vernal pools on K-6 where little mousetail occurs; Reduce the effect of alien plants; Enhance the populations of sensitive species; Stabilize soils on mounds and in watershed areas; Provide research and educational opportunities	Applicable	Satisfied: The Project design avoids vernal pools; Habitat restoration is an ongoing POM management and implementation of restoration responsibility.	The Proposed Project has been designed to avoid all vernal pools observed during site surveys. The project applicant will consult with USFWS to determine if additional fairy shrimp surveys are required for purposes of federal Endangered Species Act compliance. Note also that the finalized Vernal Pool Preservation Area, (as defined in the RMP 2), encompasses all vernal pools identified for conservation by the Phase 1 RMP and the total area exceeds the 330-acre requirement. Habitat restoration and enhancement opportunities will be identified and implemented by the POM. See the RMP 2 and RMP 2 Update (2018).
36	Potential indirect impacts shall be mitigated by providing a minimum 100-foot width buffer area around the vernal pools and their watershed. A larger buffer area and implementation of other measures (e.g., fencing, educational signage, diversion of urban runoff), shall be required as necessary to eliminate adverse effects of drainage, trampling, vehicles, dumping, and collecting and to provide sufficient resources to support appropriate pollinators and dispersal agents.	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Accomplished through Project design and avoidance of vernal pools	The R3 vernal pool is located adjacent to the Proposed Project. Proctor Valley Road was designed to avoid impacts to R3 and to provide a minimum of a 100-foot buffer from the vernal pool watershed.
	Woodlands (Coast Live Oak Woodland, Southern Live Oak Riparian Forest, Southern Interior Cypress Forest, and Sycamore Alluvial Woo			
37	The project is designed to preserve 100 percent of the southern interior cypress forest, coast live oak woodland, and southern live oak riparian forest and sycamore alluvial woodland	Applicable	<u>Satisfied.</u> Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	The Proposed Project will not impact any of these vegetation communities.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
38	Potential indirect impacts shall be mitigated by providing a minimum 100-foot width buffer area around the sensitive habitat, within which no development or landscaping shall be allowed. Impacts to these woodlands from hydrological alterations (including potential displacement of native woodland habitats with exotic and wetland species) shall be avoided. The storm drain system shall be engineered to achieve the pre-impact hydrology for each of the woodland habitat types.	Not Applicable		Coast Live Oak Woodland, Southern Interior Cypress Forest, and Sycamore Alluvial Woodland do not occur within the Project Area. There is Southern Live Oak Riparian Forest within RMP Preserve areas adjacent to the Proposed Project. This vegetation community is located more than the minimum required 100-foot buffer from the Development Footprint.
	Significant Effect: State-listed endangered plant species would be impacted. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.4-4 - 4.9.4-5]			
39	Updated sensitive plant surveys shall be conducted to quantify acreage of occupied habitat and plant densities or population sizes for each SPA	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete. Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in Project level EIR.	Updated plant surveys were conducted for the Project Area. (Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1).
40	The project shall be designed to attain the species-specific preservation standards defined below	Applicable	Achieved through Specific Plan design and compliance with RMP and MSCP. Also achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures: Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR. See state- listed endangered plant species preservation standards below.	The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for each species. (M-BI-11)
41	Indirect impacts to preserved populations of all sensitive plant species shall be avoided or minimized by implementing the following measures:	Applicable	Achieved through RMP and MSCP Compliance. Also achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	See Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 1)
	Buffers (i.e., setbacks from developed, landscaped, or other use areas) shall be provided around the occupied and/or critical habitat (e.g., watershed for vernal pools, floodplain or drainage for willowy monardella) for all preserved populations. Buffers shall be of adequate size and configuration to eliminate adverse effects of trampling, vehicles, dumping, collecting, and adjacent construction, and, in conjunction with the preserved habitat, shall include sufficient resources to support appropriate pollinators. Buffer widths shall be a minim um of 50 feet. Buffer widths shall be determined on a species-specific basis and will be dependent on the sensitivity of the species, the susceptibility/ tolerance of the species and/or its habitat to disturbance, and the adjacent land use.			A 100-foot Preserve Edge buffer is incorporated into the Proposed Project's Development Footprint. The Preserve Edge Plan details the restrictions and management of the preserve edge.
	Significant impacts to state listed endangered plant species shall require a mitigation plan at the Specific Plan level of analysis. Such a plan shall include an experimental phase and a maintenance and monitoring program; however, the length of the experimental and mitigation phases shall be governed by success criteria specified in the mitigation plans rather than by a set number of years.			There are populations of Otay tarplant (the only state/federally-listed species within the Development Footprint) within offsite improvement areas associated with the segment of Proctor Valley Road located in the City of Chula Vista. Mitigation for impacts to this species have already been provided under a previous project: Rolling Hills Ranch. Therefore, impacts to Otay tarplant associated with improvements to Proctor Valley Road have already been analyzed, disclosed, and mitigated.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	<ul> <li>For sensitive species occurring within seasonal streams, the water runoff from surrounding development shall be diverted and controlled to retain the same amount and seasonality of water input existing before development. A study to determine existing hydrological conditions and a hydrological analysis of the streams within the proposed development that contain sensitive plant species shall be required at the Specific Plan level of analysis. The results of these studies shall be used to engineer the storm drain system to reflect pre-impact hydrological conditions over the long term. Species occurring in intermittent streams for which the above mitigation shall apply include willowy monardella, Otay manzanita, Orcutt's brodiaea, summer-holly, Tecate cypress, San Diego sagewort, Orcutt's birdbeak, San Diego marsh-elder, spiny rush, Campo clarkia, San Miguel savory, and Engelmann oak.</li> <li>A Fire Management Plan shall be developed in accordance with the RMP to protect and appropriately manage populations of sensitive plant species.</li> </ul>			<ul> <li>A Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2) and Hydromodification Flow Control Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-4) have been prepared for the Proposed Project which comply with San Diego County BMP Design Manual requirements. These studies analyze the hydrological (0.1Q2- Q10 events) changes proposed with the development and compares it to the preimpact condition. The proposed storm drain facilities are designed to achieve compliance.</li> <li>A Fire Protection Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-2) has been prepared for the Proposed Project and includes fuel management strategies in conformance with RMP and MSCP County Subarea Plan requirements. (M-BI-19)</li> </ul>
	San Diego thorn-mint			( 2. 73)
42	The project is designed to preserve the largest San Diego thorn-mint population and 95% of the overall species onsite, including watershed, any associated critical habitat and a minimum of a 100-foot width buffer zone	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Thorn-mint does not occur within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
43	Thorn-mint shall be introduced on appropriate soils on the Project site. The creation of artificial populations shall require seed salvage of impacted populations, nursery propagation to increase seed and sowing of seed	Not Applicable		Thorn-mint does not occur within the Proposed Project.
44	A clay soil lens suitable for San Diego thorn-mint that is not presently occupied by this species shall be used for the mitigation area. If no such area is available as determined by a plant ecologist and a soil scientist during the experimental phase of the mitigation program, acquisition and long-term protection of an offsite population shall be required	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project is not within the referenced mitigation area.
	San Diego button celery			
45	The project is designed to preserve 95 percent of species onsite and to preserve 100 percent of species where occurring with other vernal pool indicator species	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	San Diego button celery does not occur within the Proposed Project. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
46	Vernal pools shall be restored and the species shall be re-introduced into disturbed or historical vernal pools	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through Project design and avoidance of vernal pools.	Button celery was observed within a vernal pool (R3 complex) located <u>outside</u> of the Project Area. Proctor Valley Road was redesigned to avoid impacts to R3. R3 will not be impacted by the Proposed Project and will remain in Preserve under CDFW management.
	Otay tarplant			
47	The project is designed to preserve 80 percent of the species on site	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design. See discussion.	Otay Tarplant occurs within the Proctor Valley Road offsite improvement areas in the City of Chula Vista.  Otay tarplant does not occur within the Applicant's ownership or elsewhere offsite. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	,		species-specific preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
				There are populations within offsite improvement areas associated with the segment of Proctor Valley Road located in the City of Chula Vista. Mitigation for impacts to this species have already been provided under a previous project within the City of Chula Vista: Rolling Hills Ranch. Therefore, impacts to Otay tarplant associated with improvements to Proctor Valley Road have already been analyzed, disclosed, and mitigated.
48	The species shall be introduced in areas with appropriate soils, including seed salvage and nursery propagation to increase seed sowing	Not Applicable		Impacts to Otay tarplant associated with improvements to Proctor Valley Road have already been analyzed, disclosed, and mitigated. See Comment #47 above.
	Willowy Monardella			
49	The project is designed to preserve 100 percent of the species on site	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Willowy Monardella does not occur within the Project Area. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranchwide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
50	Water input shall be regulated to prevent significant indirect impacts from decreased or increased water flow from the development	Not Applicable		Willowy Monardella does not occur within the Project Area in either development or RMP preserve areas that would be affected by project runoff.
51	The intact population shall be monitored for 5 years to assure that indirect impacts (trampling, dumping and hydrological alterations) of the development do not jeopardize the intact population. Remedial measures (restoration, trash removal and fencing repair) must be implemented to assure preservation of the intact population.	Not applicable		Willowy Monardella does not occur within the Project Area in either development or RMP preserve areas that would be affected by project runoff.
	Second, Third and Fourth Priority Plant Species			
52	Sensitive plant surveys shall be conducted to quantify acreage of occupied habitat and plant densities or population sizes for each SPA.	Applicable	Satisfied/Completed: Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in Project level EIR.	Updated plant surveys were conducted for the Project Area. See EIR Section 2.4 and the Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1)
53	The project is designed to achieve the (following) species-specific preservation standards.	Applicable	See below #57- 89	Measure 53 is a summary/general measure that introduces more specific measures to follow. As shown below, the Proposed Project includes preparation of site-specific surveys, analysis, mitigation measures and compliance with regulatory requirements. See specific comments to address species identified in #57 to 89 below. (M-BI-3)
54	Significant impacts to second, third and fourth priority plant species shall require a mitigation plan at the Specific Plan level. The mitigation plan shall require an experimental phase and a maintenance and monitoring program however, the length of the experimental and monitoring phases shall be governed by attainment of success criteria set forth in the species mitigation plan rather than by a set number of years	Applicable	Achieved with compliance with RMP, MSCP and BMO. Further satisfied through updated or replacement Project-level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resources Salvage and Restoration Plan.	The Project EIR includes a more in-depth Project-level assessment of project impacts on second, third or fourth priority plants. This assessment also takes into account intervening actions, such as adoption of the MSCP plan (1998) and MSCP County Subarea plan (1997), that provide further conservation and protection for such plants. By following the requirements/guidelines of the MSCP, BMO and RMP and satisfying the RMP Conveyance Obligation for the Proposed Project by conveying RMP

			1	Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
		Acciliant	Askinged through DMD and MOOD	Preserve land to the Otay Ranch Preserve Owner/ Manager and preserving additional habitat through Conserved Open Space, the Proposed Project's impacts to second, third, and fourth priority species would be less than what was contemplated in the 1993 PEIR. Through these measures, the Proposed Project would contribute to the Ranch-wide preservation standards for each species that occurs within the Project Area. RMP Policy 3.2 mandates that the RMP restoration programs be accomplished by the project applicant in coordination with the County and the Preserve Owner/Manager (POM). M- BI-11 describes the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan(s) which will be implemented to satisfy this policy requirement.
55	Indirect impacts shall be prevented through provision of buffers, manipulation of hydrological conditions, and a fire management plan	Applicable	Achieved through RMP and MSCP compliance. Further satisfied through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures: Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR (M-BI-19 Fire Protection).	A Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 1) and a Fire Protection Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-2) were prepared for the Proposed Project. Consistent with these plans, the Proposed Project includes a 100-foot Preserve Edge/ Fuel Modification Zone buffer within the Development Footprint at the perimeter of the Proposed Project. In addition, a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1 and Major Stormwater Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2) were prepared for the Proposed Project. These studies were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. The Project implements biofiltration basins throughout the Project Site to mitigate for water quality. The Drainage Study details peak discharges at every outlet, including each culvert within the Proposed Project. The hydromodification basins detailed in the Major Storm Water Management Plan are designed to mitigate all post development flow volumes to predevelopment levels.  A Fire Protection Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-2) was prepared for the Proposed Project which details the requirement that fuel management activities occur within the 100' Fuel Modification Zone provided within the Development Footprint, in conformance with the RMP and MSCP County Subarea Plan. (M-BI-1, M-BI-2, M-BI-12, M-BI-14 through M-BI-20)
56	Indirect impacts to preserved populations of all sensitive plant species shall be avoided or minimized by implementing the following measures:	Applicable	Achieved through Project Design Features and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	
	Buffers (i.e., setbacks from developed, landscaped, or other use areas) shall be provided around the occupied and/or critical habitat (e.g., watershed for vernal pools, floodplain or drainage for willowy monardella) for all preserved populations. Buffers shall be of adequate size and configuration to eliminate adverse effects of trampling, vehicles, dumping, collecting, and adjacent construction, and, in conjunction with the preserved habitat, shall include sufficient resources to support appropriate pollinators. Buffer widths shall be a minimum of 50 feet for second, and third priority species and 25 feet for fourth priority species. Buffer widths shall be determined on a		Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	A Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 1)     was prepared for the Proposed Project. The     Proposed Project includes a 100-foot Preserve Edge     buffer within the Development Footprint at the     perimeter of the Proposed Project. The Preserve

			T	Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	species-specific basis and will be dependent on the sensitivity of the species, the susceptibility/ tolerance of the species and/or its habitat to disturbance, and the adjacent land use.  For sensitive species occurring within seasonal streams, the water runoff from surrounding development shall be diverted and controlled to retain the same amount and seasonality of water input existing before development. A study to determine existing hydrological	•		Edge Plan addresses RMP Preserve adjacency guidelines in conformance with the RMP and MSCP County Subarea Plan.  • A Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1 and Major
	conditions and a hydrological analysis of the streams within the proposed development that contain sensitive plant species shall be required at the Specific Plan level of analysis.			Stormwater Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2) were prepared for the Proposed Project. These studies were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. (M-BI-14)
	Species occurring in intermittent streams for which the above mitigation would apply include willowy monardella, Otay manzanita, Orcutt's brodiaea, summer-holly, Tecate cypress, San Diego sagewort, Orcutt's bird-beak, San Diego marsh-elder, spiny rush, and Campo clarkia, San Miguel savory, and Engelmann oak.      The Market All Control of the C			Preserved populations of Otay manzanita, San Diego sagewort, San Diego marsh-elder, spiny rush and San Miguel savory occur within the Proposed Project in areas designated RMP Preserve. (M-BI-3)
	A Fire Management Plan shall be developed in accordance with the RMP to protect and appropriately manage populations of sensitive plant species			A Fire Protection Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-2) was prepared for the Proposed Project which details the requirement that fuel management activities occur within the 100' Fuel Modification Zone provided within the Development Footprint, in conformance with the RMP and MSCP County Subarea Plan. The 100' Fuel Modification Zone is not located within the RMP/MSCP Preserve. (M-BI-19)
	Otay Manzanita			,
57	The project is designed to preserve at least 80 percent of the species onsite, including populations in northern Jamul Mountains.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Otay Manzanita does not occur within the Development Footprint; all occurrences are within the RMP Preserve. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
58	Impacted plants shall be propagated and re-established to suitable slopes.	Not Applicable		Otay Manzanita does not occur within Development Footprint.
	Orcutt's Brodiaea			
59	The project is designed to preserve 75 percent of the species onsite.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, MSCP standards, and regulatory compliance with the RMP conveyance requirement. Measures incorporated into the Project-level EIR.	Orcutt's Brodiaea occurs within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species. It should be noted that project specific populations are not material to the determination of meeting the Otay Ranch preservation goal, as consistency with the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint satisfies this requirement.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
60	Water input shall be regulated to prevent significant indirect impacts from increased or decreased water flow from development; the buffer requirements and pre-impact hydrological studies and design of a low-flow diversion system described above shall be implemented.	Not Applicable		All known locations of Orcutt's Brodiaea occur within the Development Footprint. There are no individuals located in the RMP Preserve and therefore this mitigation measure does not apply.
61	<ul> <li>A five-year monitoring of intact population shall be required to:</li> <li>Identify significant indirect impacts of development (e.g., trampling, dumping, hydrological alterations); and</li> <li>Implement remedial measures (e.g., restoration, trash removal, repair fencing, etc.).</li> </ul>	Not Applicable		See comment #60. There are no conserved locations of this species within the RMP Preserve.
	Variegated Hasseanthus (Dudleya)	,		
62	The project is designed to preserve 75 percent of the species onsite, including representative population(s) from each of the three parcels	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, RMP regulatory compliance and MSCP standards. Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	Variegated dudleya occurs within the Project Area. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.  Although variegated dudleya is a Covered Species in the MSCP County Subarea Plan, the BMO requires mitigation for impacts to this species at a 3:1 ratio and the RMP requires translocation of impacted individuals. Since the BMO requirements are more stringent, the project specific
63	Impacted plants shall be transplanted to appropriate habitat and clay soils within same parcel.	Applicable	Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	mitigation will be implemented. Therefore, no net loss of the species is anticipated. (M-BI-11)  Impacted plants within the Development Footprint will be translocated as per the regulatory requirements of the RMP and/or BMO requirements. See EIR Section 2.4, including Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. A Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan will be prepared as a condition of the Proposed Project. The Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan will, at a minimum, evaluate options for plant salvage and relocation, including individual plant salvage and additional plantings, native plant mulching, selective soil salvaging, application of plant materials on manufactured slopes, and application/relocation of resources within the RMP Preserve or Conserved Open Space. (M-BI-11)
	San Diego Coast Barrel Cactus			
64	The project is designed to preserve 75 percent of the species onsite, including representative populations from each of the three parcels.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, RMP regulatory compliance and MSCP standards. Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	San Diego barrel cactus occurs within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.  Although San Diego barrel cactus is a Covered Species in the MSCP County Subarea Plan, the BMO requires mitigation for impacts to this species at a 2:1 ratio and the RMP requires translocation of impacted individuals. Since

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
				the BMO requirements are more stringent, the project specific mitigation will be implemented. Therefore, no net loss of the species is anticipated. (M-BI-11)  There are additional impacts to San Diego barrel cactus which occur off-site as a result of implementing Proctor Valley Road; however, those impacted plants are not regulated by the Otay Ranch RMP/PEIR, rather, they are covered under the City of San Diego and City of Chula Vista MSCP Subarea Plans.
65	Impacted plants shall be transplanted to appropriate habitat within same parcel.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	The Project will comply with the MSCP, BMO and RMP, including measures requiring salvage plans. Impacted plants within the Development Footprint will be translocated as per the regulatory requirements of the RMP and/or BMO requirements. See EIR Section 2.4, including Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. See Comment #63 above for discussion of the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.
	San Diego Goldenstar	·		<u> </u>
66	The project is designed to preserve 54 percent of known point occurrences for the species onsite, including representative populations from each of the three parcels	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, RMP regulatory compliance and MSCP standards. Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	The San Diego Goldenstar occurs within the Project Area.  San Diego Goldenstar is a covered species under the MSCP County Subarea Plan. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.  Although San Diego goldenstar is a Covered Species under the Otay Ranch RMP and MSCP Plan, some impacts to San Diego goldenstar occur on lands subject to the BMO (3:1 mitigation) and impacts to this species are also subject to RMP translocation requirements (1:1 mitigation). See EIR Section 2.4, including Table 2.4-7, M-
67	Corms and soil shall be salvaged and species shall be introduced in appropriate soils and habitat in protected open space within the same parcel	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	BI-11and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1.  The Project will comply with the MSCP, BMO and RMP, including measures requiring salvage plans. Impacted plants within the Development Footprint will be translocated as per the regulatory requirements of the RMP and/or BMO requirements. (M-BI-11) See EIR Section 2.4, including Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. See Comment #63 above for discussion of the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	San Diego Navarretia			
68	The project is designed to preserve 100 percent of the presently known locations of the species and retaining all of the 129 pools complex with Navarretia	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Navarretia does not occur within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
	Snake Cholla			
69	The project is designed to preserve 80 percent of the species on site.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Snake cholla does not occur within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
70	Impacted plants shall be transplanted to restored coastal sage scrub in protected open space.	Not Applicable		Snake cholla does not occur within the Project Area.
	Narrow-leaved Nightshade			
71	The project is designed to preserve 75 percent of the species.	Applicable	Satisfied: Solanum xanti is a common species no longer classified as sensitive. Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Narrow-leaved night shade occurs within the Project Area. Narrow-leaved nightshade is now taxonomically included in Solanum xanti which is a common species with no sensitivity (see MSCP County Subarea Plan, Table 3-5 and CNPS). The RMP 2 update acknowledges that this species is no longer considered sensitive and this conservation goal is no longer applicable. Narrow-leaved Nightshade is a covered species in the MSCP County Subarea Plan. (M-BI-3)
72	The species shall be re-established in disturbed areas with suitable soils or introduced in suitable open space.	Not Applicable		Since adoption of the 1993 PEIR, the scientific community has reevaluated the status of this plant and determined that it no longer qualifies as sensitive. Table 3-5 of the MSCP Plan states that this species is now taxonomically included in <i>Solanum xanti</i> which is not a sensitive plant species per CNPS. Accordingly, impacts to this species are no longer considered significant. Thus, no mitigation measure is required for such impacts.
	Delicate Clarkia			
73	The project is designed to preserve 75 percent of the species on site and to avoid all impacts to the population in the canyon in northeastern Jamul Mountains.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and regulatory compliance with the RMP conveyance requirement. Measures incorporated into the Project-level EIR.	Delicate clarkia occurs in the offsite road improvements in Planning Area 16. The number of individuals affected is small, and thus the impact would be less than significant. The project conforms to the Otay Ranch RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species. It should be noted that project specific populations are not material to the determination of meeting the Otay Ranch preservation goal, as consistency with the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint satisfies this requirement. (M-BI-3)

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Orcutt's Bird-beak			
74	The project is designed to preserve 75 percent of the species on site and to avoid all impacts to population in the canyon south of the San Diego Air Sport Center. To avoid indirect impacts in the canyon south of the San Diego Air Sports Center all canyon slopes shall also be included in open space.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Orcutt's Bird-beak does not occur within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
	San Diego Marsh-elder			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
75	The project is designed to retain 75 percent of the species on site.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and RMP regulatory compliance. Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	San Diego Marsh-elder occurs within the Project Area. The Proposed Project conforms to the Otay Ranch RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species- specific preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species. The Proposed Project will also comply with species specific requirements as discussed in #76.  In addition, some lands in the GDP/SRP area designated for development in 1993 (e.g., Village 15) containing San Diego marsh elder have been subsequently converted to conservation uses. This provides supplemental protection for the species covered by this mitigation measures. It should be noted that project specific populations are not material to the determination of meeting the Otay Ranch preservation goal, as consistency with the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint satisfies this requirement. (M-BI- 11)
76	The species shall be revegetated at a 2:1 ratio (restored to impacted habitat) in intermittent drainages that have been disturbed.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan	The Project will comply with the BMO and RMP, which require replacement and restoration of habitat. Areas subject to the BMO will be required to mitigate for impacts to San Diego marsh elder at a 1:1 ratio for impacts to individual plants. The remaining portions of the Project Area are subject to the RMP requirements which are less stringent than the BMO. The RMP requires restoration of intermittent drainages where this species occurs. There are 0.65 acres (consisting of 125 individuals) of San Diego marsh elder located in intermittent drainages which are subject to the Otay Ranch RMP's 2:1 restoration requirement. See EIR Section 2.4, Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. Any temporarily impacted area suitable for revegetation with this species will be included within the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan (See Comment #63).  Additional avoidance of this species is provided in areas of Conserved Open Space. (M-BI-11)

			1	Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		Сопірпансе
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
77	Container plants shall be propagated with seed collected from the Project site.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	Seed from the Project Area will be utilized to the extent practicable and feasible. (M-BI-11)
78	The species shall be included in restoration of alkali meadow habitat	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	This species occurs within areas mapped as cismontane alkali marsh and therefore mitigation required for this vegetation community (see Comment #30 and #31) would likely include additional mitigation for this plant species.  Per M-Bl-21, if mitigation for jurisdictional resources is proposed to occur within the Project Area or within the additional off-site areas needed for conveyance, then a Wetlands Mitigation and Monitoring Plan shall be prepared. This plan will include the incorporation of this species.  Additional avoidance of this species is provided in areas of Conserved Open Space.
	Munz's Sage			Conserved Open Space.
79	The project is designed to preserve 46 percent of point occurrences for the species.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and RMP regulatory compliance. Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	Munz's Sage occurs within the Project Area. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.  Impacts to Munz's sage would be less than significant due to conservation of the species on the Project site and elsewhere within Otay Ranch (See EIR Section 2.4, including Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1).  However, Project-Level mitigation measures would provide for the preservation of existing populations and suitable habitat for the species and would ensure that impacted areas of coastal sage scrub dominated by Munz's sage would be mitigated in accordance with the RMP (see Comment #80 below). (M-BI-11)
80	Munz's sage dominated coastal sage scrub shall be restored at a 2:1 ratio (restored to impacted habitat) using seed and container plants.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance with the RMP and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan	The mitigation measures recommended in the 1993 PEIR focused on Munz's sage dominated coastal sage scrub (CSS), recommending that CSS with 50% or more Munz's sage be restored at a 2:1 ratio based on acreage. The Proposed Project contains approximately 6.2 acres of Munz's sage dominated CSS out of 804.1 acres of CSS overall. The Project would impact approximately 2.5 acres of the Munz's sage dominated CSS. Although this impact is not considered significant from a CEQA perspective, the

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Cyronicle Cyronical above.			RMP requires that projects restore impacted Munz's sage dominated CSS (5.0 acres). The Project will comply with the RMP, including measures requiring restoration plans. See EIR Section 2.4, Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. See Comment #63 above for discussion of the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan. (M-BI-11)
0.1	Greene's Ground-cherry	Applicable	Catiofical Company conducted at	Cyconolo sycumd chayer do so not accur within the
81	Additional survey work shall be conducted to verify presence of this species	Applicable	Satisfied: Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in project EIR.	Greene's ground cherry does not occur within the Project Area. Updated plant surveys were conducted for the Project Area. (See Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1)
82	If present, the project shall be designed to preserve at least 50 percent of the species	Not Applicable		Greene's ground cherry does not occur within the Project
83	The species shall be re-established or introduced into suitable habitat, using seed salvage and nursery propagation to increase seed source			Area.
	San Diego County Stipa			
84	The project is designed to preserve at least 75 percent of the species on site.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance with the RMP and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	San Diego County Stipa occurs within the Project Area.  The Proposed project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation ranchwide standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.  The identified impact is less than significant because this is a List D species and the project would not jeopardize the local, long-term viability of the species. Nevertheless, by following the guidelines of the RMP and satisfying the RMP Conveyance Obligation for the Proposed Project by conveying RMP Preserve land to the Otay Ranch Preserve Owner/Manager and preserving additional habitat through Conserved Open Space and non-impacted Limited Development Areas, the Proposed Project would reduce the impacts to this species. With these measures, the Proposed Project would contribute to the ranch-wide preservation standards for this species. (M-BI-3)  It should be noted that project specific populations are not material to the determination of meeting the Otay Ranch preservation goal, as consistency with the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint satisfies this requirement.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
85	The species shall be re-established in disturbed areas or introduced in suitable open space; the re-establishment shall include seed salvage, propagation of nursery plugs, and planting of plugs and seed.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance with the RMP and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	Per the RMP, Restoration of native grassland will be concentrated in the Otay River Valley (RMP, Figure 22). Areas available for native grassland creation include nonnative grassland in the Otay River Valley. Disturbed valley needlegrass grassland in the Proctor Valley Parcel represent potential areas for native grassland enhancement particularly in the vernal pool study area (RMP, Figure 23). These areas of disturbed valley needlegrass grassland occur within Village 13 and was not within Village 14.  However, the RMP also requires species-specific mitigation, including translocation of impacted individuals. The Project will comply with the RMP, including measures requiring translocation of sensitive species. See EIR Section 2.4, Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. See Comment #63 above for discussion of the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan. (M-BI-11)
	San Diego Sunflower			
86	The project is designed to retain at least 75 percent of the species.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and RMP regulatory compliance. Achieved through Updated and/or Replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	San Diego sunflower occurs within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.  The identified impact is less than significant because this is a List D species and the project would not jeopardize the local, long-term viability of the species. However, Project-Level mitigation measures would provide for the preservation of existing populations and suitable habitat for the species and would ensure that impacted areas of coastal sage scrub dominated by San Diego sunflower (i.e. San Diego County viguiera) would be mitigated in accordance with the RMP (see Comment #87 below). It should be noted that project specific populations are not material to the determination of meeting the Otay Ranch preservation goal, as consistency with the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint satisfies this requirement.

**DUDEK** 

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
87	Viguiera-dominated coastal sage scrub shall be restored at a 2:1 ratio (restored to impacted habitat) using seed from the ranch.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance with the RMP and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Project-level EIR mitigation includes a Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan.	The mitigation measures recommended in the 1993 PEIR focused on <i>Viguiera-dominated</i> dominated coastal sage scrub (CSS), recommending that CSS with 50% or more <i>Viguiera-dominated</i> be restored at a 2:1 ratio based on acreage. The Proposed Project contains approximately 6.0 acres of <i>Viguiera-dominated</i> dominated CSS –out of 804.1 acres of CSS overall. The Project would impact approximately 0.9 acres of the Viguiera-dominated CSS. Although this impact is not considered significant from a CEQA perspective, the RMP requires that projects restore impacted <i>Viguiera-dominated</i> dominated coastal sage scrub (1.8 acres). The Project will comply with the RMP, including measures requiring restoration plans. See EIR Section 2.4, Table 2.4-7, and Biological Resources Report Appendix 2.4.1. See Comment #63 above for discussion of the Biological Resource Salvage and Restoration Plan. (M-BI-11)
	California Adder's-tongue Fern	'		,
88	Project is designed to preserve at least 50 percent of the species onsite.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	California Adder's-tongue Fern does not occur within the Project Area  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
	Coulter's Matilija Poppy			
89	Project is designed to preserve at least 50 percent of the species onsite.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Coulter's Matilija Poppy does not occur within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based, and therefore complies with the ranch-wide standards established for this species.
	Significant Effect: Impact to Least Bell's vireo, tricolored blackbird, and the southwestern willow flycatcher habitat. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p	p. 4.9.4-5 through 4.9.4-7]		
00	Least Bell's Vireo and Southwestern Willow Flycatcher  One hundred persent for approved Hebitat Consequetion Plan (Sep Diogo Multiple Species Consequetion Program (HCD/MSCD) etanderde) of	Applicable	Catiofied: Accomplished through	Locat Poll's Vivas and Couthwestern Willow Charteles
90	One hundred percent (or approved Habitat Conservation Plan/San Diego Multiple Species Conservation Program (HCP/MSCP) standards) of occupied habitat for these species shall be preserved.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Least Bell's Vireo and Southwestern Willow Flycatcher habitat do not occur within the Project Area. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based and is consistent with MSCP development and preserve boundaries and standards. Therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the RMP and MSCP standards established for this species.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
91	Prior to the first SPA containing Least Bell's habitat, the Applicant shall conduct a focused study of Least Bell's vireo distribution and abundance along Otay River and Dulzura Creek adjacent to the San Ysidro parcel. Prior to the first SPA containing Southwestern Willow Flycatcher's habitat, the Applicant shall conduct a focused study of Southwestern Willow Flycatcher's distribution and abundance along Otay River and Dulzura Creek adjacent to the San Ysidro parcel. Direct impacts from construction or expansion of the following roads to both species shall be assessed:  Otay Valley Road in Otay River Valley Heritage Road crossing of Otay River La Media Road crossing of Otay River SR-125 crossing of Otay River Otay Lakes Road at Dulzura Creek Alta Road crossing of Otay River, if constructed. Any additional roads that cross or run adjacent to Otay River or Dulzura Creek that have the potential to significantly impact Least Bell's vireo	Not Applicable		The measure applies to portions of the Otay Valley and San Ysidro Parcels., The Proposed Project is within the Proctor Valley Parcel.
92	A mitigation plan shall be prepared and implemented for any direct impacts from road construction. Measures in the plan shall include one or more of the following as required to reduce the impact below a level of significance:  The project's roadways shall be designed to avoid all direct impacts to occupied vireo habitat. Potential realignments may include:  Otay Valley Parkway.  La Media Road - Design to avoid occupied habitat.  Otay Lakes Road.  Alta Road.  Riparian habitat shall be restored or enhanced along the Otay River Valley in exchange for impacting unoccupied potential vireo habitat.	Not Applicable		Vireo and flycatcher habitat does not occur within the Project Area or within off-site Proctor Valley Road improvement areas.  The Proposed Project is within the Proctor Valley Parcel and does not propose realignment of the roadways listed.
93	Prior to approval of the first SPA containing Least Bell's Vireo, the Applicant shall conduct a study of indirect impacts (see below) on this species from proposed development and roads, effects of a village center and residential housing on the Dulzura Creek Least Bell's vireo population, the effects of the proposed Otay Valley Regional Park on the Otay River population, and the effects of roads on both populations. Evaluation of impacts shall be based on the baseline data in the Final Program EIR and from current distribution and abundance data obtained from surveys conducted at the Specific Plan level. A partial listing of potential indirect development and road impacts which shall be considered are:  Human activity and disturbance.  Noise impacts from roads and adjacent development. A noise study shall be conducted to determine noise impacts from roads adjacent to, within or near vireo habitat, and from development adjacent to vireo habitat (e.g., at Dulzura Creek).  Introduced predators such as cats.  Increased potential for brown-headed cowbird parasitism. Construction noise, dust, and disturbance.  Invasion of non-native vegetation (i.e., Eucalyptus species, Arundo species, etc.)  Artificial lighting from developed areas. Recreation related impacts.  Habitat degradation and fragmentation.  Changes in existing water quality and quantity which could negatively affect riparian habitat	Not Applicable		Vireo or Flycatcher do not occur within the Project Area or within off-site Proctor Valley Road improvement areas.  The Proposed Project is within the Proctor Valley Parcel. These measures apply to the Otay Valley and San Ysidro Parcels

				Compliance
_	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
94	If it is determined during the environmental review for SPA plans that indirect impacts from development or roads are significant, a mitigation plan shall be prepared and implemented at the Specific Plan level. This mitigation shall be incorporated into the general mitigation plan. Mitigation measures shall be based on approved standards by the appropriate public agency(ies) in effect at the time of the SPA development. Mitigation shall parallel the recommendations in the Resource Management Plan (e.g., in regards to lighting, plantings allowed in landscaping adjacent to occupied habitat, etc.). At a minimum, the following measures shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:  Restrict human access to occupied habitat in the breeding season (March 15 to August 31).	Not Applicable	metriou	Vireo or flycatcher do not occur within the Project Area or within off-site Proctor Valley Road improvement, areas and therefore no significant indirect effects have been identified in the Project level EIR.
	<ul> <li>Require a minimum of a 100-foot biological and an adjoining 100-foot planting buffer along the edges of occupied, potential, and restored habitats.</li> <li>As necessary, increase open space easements to buffer noise impacts pending recommendations of the noise study.</li> <li>Implement an introduced predator management program. Implement a brown-headed cowbird management program.</li> <li>Employ measures to reduce construction impacts, including avoiding construction adjacent to or within occupied habitat during the breeding season (March 15 to August 31).</li> <li>Limit landscaping adjacent to occupied habitat (within the buffer zones) to native vegetation.</li> <li>Restrict the use of invasive, introduced plantings in all landscaping adjacent to the buffer zones.</li> <li>Restrict lighting close to occupied habitat.</li> <li>Maintain and enhance where appropriate the existing water quality and quantity in occupied, potential, and restored habitats for this species.</li> </ul>			
95	Prior to approval of the first SPA, a management plan in conjunction with the RMP shall be prepared and implemented for this species. The species management plan shall include provisions for periodic monitoring of populations within the preserve as well as any significant onsite populations not included within the Management Preserve. The species management plan shall include appropriate management techniques approved by the resource agencies to maintain and, where feasible, to enhance existing onsite population(s).	Not Applicable		Vireo or Flycatcher do not occur within the Project Area or with in off-site Proctor Valley Road improvement, areas and therefore no significant effects have been identified in the Project level EIR.
	Tricolored Blackbird			
96	The project is designed to provide one hundred percent (or approved HCP/MSCP standards) of nesting habitat for this species.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Tricolored Blackbird does not occur within the Project Area.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP County Subarea Plan Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the standards established for this species.
97	At the Specific Plan level, the applicant shall conduct focused breeding surveys for this species in appropriate habitat.  Direct and indirect impacts shall be assessed to breeding habitat from proposed development and roads. This includes assessing noise impacts from any proposed road alignments adjacent to proposed habitat.	Not Applicable		No suitable habitat exists in the Project Area; therefore, focused breeding surveys were not required.
	from any proposed road alignments adjacent to preserved habitat.  Preserve in natural open space all occupied and restored breeding habitat, and where feasible, potential breeding habitat.  Include within the Management Preserve all preserved habitat.  To mitigate for impacts to potential habitat, restore or enhance suitable breeding marsh habitat along the Otay River.  Avoid construction of roads and other development during the breeding season (March 1 to August 31).  Preserve in open space buffer zones around occupied, potential, and restored habitats. The minimum width of the buffer zone shall be determined at the Specific Plan level in conjunction with, and upon the approval, of the resource agencies.			
	Mitigation for foraging habitat loss shall be done in conjunction with mitigation for raptor grassland foraging habitat.  Prepare and implement a management plan for this species.			



				Compliance
	Mittenstine Manager (Nata - the engine and a defined in this solvens in the entire Oten Bounds)	Applicable to Proposed	Method	Discussion
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)  Cactus Wren	Project	Method	Discussion
98	The Project is designed to achieve the following standards:	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through	Cactus wren does not occur within the Project Area.
	<ul> <li>No loss of viable Cactus Wren populations;</li> <li>Preserve adequate habitat within the Preserve to maintain no loss of viable Cactus Wren populations</li> </ul>		ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the project complies with the standards established for this species.
99	At the Specific Plan level, the Applicant shall reassess impacts to this species using detailed development plans, baseline data from the Final Program EIR, and updated distribution and abundance data from Specific Plan level surveys.  The Applicant shall conduct focused surveys of appropriate habitat at the Specific Plan level to determine abundance and distribution of this species prior to development. Territories shall be delineated for those individuals/pairs which occur or could occur within or adjacent to proposed development and roads.  The Applicant shall evaluate direct impacts to territories of individuals and pairs from proposed development. Impacts to locations of pairs/individuals for which habitat has been eliminated since the start of the environmental documentation process shall also be evaluated.  Areas of CSS/MSS" habitats that shall be enhanced or restored include:  Agricultural lands on the mesa and in ravines bordering the west side of Salt Creek Canyon.  Agricultural lands, non-native grassland (NNG), and disturbed CSS habitats along the north slope of the Otay River Valley and as appropriate along the bottom of the valley.  Agricultural lands and NNG bordering and within Wolf Canyon, bordering and within Poggi Canyon, and along the shallow ravine identified as a gnatcatcher and cactus wren corridor linking the two canyons.  NNG within and adjacent to Johnson Canyon.  Unavoidable impacts to occupied habitat shall be mitigated through habitat creation, restoration, or enhancement of disturbed habitats. Impacts to high quality potential habitat and to sighting locations for which habitat has been eliminated since the start of the environmental documentation process for the Final Program EIR shall also be mitigated through habitat creation, restoration, or enhancement. Mitigation ratios for occupied and potential habitat shall be based on accepted standards of the appropriate public agency at the time SPA development occurs, and shall be set through consultation with, and approval from, the r	Not Applicable		Based on focused survey results, no suitable habitat occurs within the Project Area.
	<ul> <li>Creation, restoration, and enhancement of disturbed habitat as mitigation for occupied habitat, shall occur prior to impacting the occupied habitat. A focused study shall document occupancy and breeding of the impacted species in the created, restored, or enhanced habitat before the occupied habitat can be impacted.</li> <li>Prepare and implement a long-term management plan for this species.</li> </ul>			

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		·
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	California Gnatcatcher			
100	The Project is designed to preserve 70 percent of California Gnatcatcher habitat onsite, to restore an additional 15 percent of California Gnatcatcher habitat and to preserve 52 percent of documented pairs and individuals.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, RMP conveyance and MSCP standards. Updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	California Gnatcatcher occurs within the Project Area and within offsite improvement areas.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP Preserve design upon which the species-specific ranch-wide preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the standards established for this species. The Proposed Project will preserve habitat for three pairs observed within the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve. Note also that, since adoption of the RMP and MSCP County Subarea Plan, some lands initially slated for development have been acquired by public and private entities and committed to conservation uses only (e.g., Village 15), contain gnatcatcher, thereby reducing the amount of land within the MSCP planning area and Otay Ranch GDP/SRP subject to development impacts. This results in a conservation benefit. (M-BI-3, M-BI-4)  It should be noted that project specific populations are not material to the determination of meeting the Otay Ranch preservation goal, as consistency with the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve footprint satisfies this requirement.
101	Impacts in the following areas shall be assessed and Project standards achieved:	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project does not include impacts to areas
	Otay Lakes Road through the Jamul Mountains	The state of		described in the measure.
	Proctor Valley Road through the disjunct L-shaped parcel			
	Riverside Fairy Shrimp			
102	One hundred percent (or approved HCP/MSCP standards) of occupied habitat for this species shall be preserved.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, RMP conveyance and MSCP standards. Updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1), Riverside fairy shrimp does not occur within the Project Area. The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the standards established for this species.  Based on focused surveys prepared for the Proposed Project (See Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1), occupied habitat for Riverside fairy shrimp does not occur within the Project Area or within off-site improvement
				areas.
103	At the Specific Plan level, the Applicant shall conduct a focused study of the distribution and abundance of these species within vernal pool habitat on Otay Ranch	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in project EIR.	Based on focused survey results (See Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1), Riverside fairy shrimp does not occur within the Project Area.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
104	The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts to occupied and potential habitat (including vernal pools and associated watersheds) from proposed development and roads. The following is a partial listing of impacts which shall be considered:	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in EIR.	Based on focused survey results (See Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1), Riverside fairy shrimp does not occur within the Project Area or within off-
	<ul> <li>Direct impacts to occupied and potential habitat (including vernal pools and associated watersheds).</li> <li>Modifications of the watershed from development or roads, which could change the water availability and water quality (e.g., pool chemistry) in vernal pools. Any changes to the watershed or vernal pools themselves could affect this species in an adverse way.</li> </ul>			site improvement areas. This species is unlikely to occur within the Project Area due to lack of suitable habitat.
	<ul> <li>The introduction of harmful chemicals into vernal pools through runoff from adjacent development, roads, and other land uses.</li> <li>Habitat degradation and fragmentation from adjacent development and roads.</li> </ul>			
	• The introduction and proliferation into potential or occupied habitat of sensitive fairy shrimp, competitor species, such as <i>Branchinecta limiahli</i> . Harmful competitors could be introduced through the habitat restoration and enhancement process or through improper fairy shrimp reintroduction techniques.			
	Any adverse impacts from increased human activity and presence (e.g., off-road vehicle activity, trampling of pools, illegal dumping, etc.).			
105	A mitigation plan shall be prepared and implemented for significant direct and indirect impacts from proposed development or roads. The following shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:	Not Applicable		Based on focused survey results (See Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1), Riverside fairy
	Preserve vernal pool complexes and associated watersheds where this species occurs or has the potential to occur. The project shall be designed to avoid impacts to all occupied habitat. Additionally, the Project is designed to avoid all impacts to the greatest extent feasible, including impacts to potential habitat.			shrimp does not occur within the Project Area or within on site improvement areas, nor are they expected to occur.
	Include within the Preserve all occupied, restored, vernal pool habitat and associated watersheds.			
	Provide a 100-foot buffer around all preserved vernal pool complexes and associated watersheds.			
	• Restore or enhance disturbed vernal pool habitat to mitigate for unavoidable direct impacts to potential habitat or for indirect impacts to occupied habitat. Mitigation ratios for potential vernal pool habitat shall be based on accepted standards at the time that SPA development occurs, and shall be established through consultation with, and approval from, the resource agencies.			
	<ul> <li>Restore or enhance already disturbed habitat prior to impacting potential vernal pool habitat.</li> <li>As mitigation for impacts to potential habitat, conduct a study at the Specific Plan level concerning the feasibility of reintroducing this species into restored or enhanced vernal pool habitat. If feasible, use approved methodologies for introduction and monitoring of</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>reintroduced populations.</li> <li>Maintain connectivity, to the extent feasible, within preserved vernal pool complexes and between adjacent or nearby vernal pool groups.</li> </ul>			
	Develop and implement a plan to eliminate harmful runoff from development and roads while still maintaining sufficient water supply for maintaining and where appropriate enhancing occupied, potential, and restored vernal pool habitat.			
)6	A management plan shall be prepared and implemented for these species	Not Applicable		Riverside fairy shrimp does not occur within the Project Area or within off-site improvement areas, nor are they expected to occur.
	San Diego Fairy Shrimp			
7	The Project is designed to preserve 95 percent of occupied habitat for the species where co-occurring with vernal pool habitat.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, RMP conveyance and MSCP standards.	Based on protocol survey results, San Diego fairy shrimp occurs within the Proposed Project.
			Updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	The Proposed Project development footprint avoids all features occupied by San Diego fairy shrimp. (M-BI-7)
8	At the Specific Plan level, the Applicant shall conduct a focused study of the distribution and abundance of these species within vernal pool habitat on Otay Ranch.	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in project EIR.	Based on two-years of focused survey results, San Diego fairy shrimp was observed within the Proposed Project or but not within the off-site improvement areas. The Proposed Project avoids all features occupied by San Diego fairy shrimp.

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
109	The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts to occupied and potential habitat (including vernal pools and associated watersheds) from proposed development and roads. The following is a partial listing of impacts which shall be considered:  • Direct impacts to occupied and potential habitat (including vernal pools and associated watersheds).	Applicable	Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in Project level EIR, Section 2.4, Biological Resources (Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1). Achieved by Updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	The Proposed Project would not impact any features occupied by San Diego fairy shrimp. M-BI-7 states that the Project Applicant shall consult with the USFWS to determine if take authorization is required for impacts to San Diego fairy shrimp suitable habitat.  A minimum of a 100-foot buffer has been applied to all occupied features ensuring that each watershed will
	<ul> <li>Modifications of the watershed from development or roads which could change the water availability and water quality (e.g., pool chemistry) in vernal pools. Any changes to the watershed or vernal pools themselves could affect this species in an adverse way.</li> </ul>			remain unaltered.  The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1) and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These studies were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001.
	<ul> <li>The introduction of harmful chemicals into vernal pools through runoff from adjacent development, roads, and other land uses.</li> <li>Habitat degradation and fragmentation from adjacent development and roads.</li> </ul>			The Proposed Project implements biofiltration basins throughout the Project Area to mitigate for water quality.  The Proposed Project will integrate site design BMPs to reduce pollutant transport and treat any polluted runoff. Where feasible, site design BMPs such as conserving natural areas, maintaining natural drainage features and dispersing roof drains to landscaped areas will be implemented.
	The introduction and proliferation into potential or occupied habitat of sensitive fairy shrimp, competitor species, such as Branchinecta lindahli. Harmful competitors could be introduced through the habitat restoration and enhancement process or through improper fairy shrimp reintroduction techniques.			Source control BMPs are also proposed for the Proposed Project to avoid and reduce pollutants in storm water runoff. This Project proposes to utilize integrated pest management techniques such as landscaping with native vegetation along with proper pesticide use when maintaining vegetated area  All impacts to occupied features have been avoided. Proctor Valley Road was realigned to avoid impacts to a vernal pool. The realignment would result in the road being further away from the vernal pool than the current alignment.
	Any adverse impacts from increased human activity and presence (e.g., off-road vehicle activity, trampling of pools, illegal dumping, etc.).			The Proposed Project does not include habitat restoration. All occupied features will be located within the RMP Preserve or Conserved Open Space. Access to these areas will be restricted.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
110	A mitigation plan shall be prepared and implemented for significant direct and indirect impacts from proposed development or roads. The following shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:  • Provide a 100-foot buffer around all preserved vernal pool complexes and associated watersheds.	Applicable	Surveys conducted at Project-level and included in Project level EIR, Section 2.4, Biological Resources (Biological Resources Report, EIR	A 100-foot buffer has been applied to the watershed of the
	Restore or enhance disturbed vernal pool habitat to m1tlgate for unavoidable direct impacts to potential habitat or for indirect impacts to occupied habitat. Mitigation ratios for potential vernal pool habitat shall be based on accepted standards at the time that SPA development occurs, and shall be established through consultation with, and approval from, the resource agencies.		Appendix 2.4-1). Satisfied by Updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	R3 vernal pool located adjacent to the Project Area (identified as B2 in the Project EIR).  There are no vernal pools within the Project Area. Therefore, restoration and enhancement of vernal pools is not proposed. There are adjacent restoration activities
	Restore or enhance already disturbed habitat prior to impacting potential vernal pool habitat.			currently underway and proposed along Proctor Valley Road within the City of San Diego. The Proposed Project will not impede those restoration activities.
	<ul> <li>As mitigation for impacts to potential habitat, conduct a study at the Specific Plan level concerning the feasibility of reintroducing this species into restored or enhanced vernal pool habitat. If feasible, use approved methodologies for introduction and monitoring of reintroduced populations.</li> </ul>			There are no vernal pools within the Project Area and therefore mitigation for potential habitat is not proposed.  Avoidance of R3 and its watershed has been incorporated to the Proposed Project There are no adjacent vernal.
	Maintain connectivity, to the extent feasible, within vernal pool complexes and between adjacent or nearby vernal pool groups.			to the Proposed Project. There are no adjacent vernal pools that require maintaining connection.
	Develop and implement a plan to eliminate harmful runoff from development and roads while still maintaining sufficient water supply for maintaining and where appropriate enhancing occupied, potential, and restored vernal pool habitat.			The watershed of R3 will not be impacted by the Proposed Project and, therefore, the water supply to this feature will be maintained.
111	A management plan shall be prepared and implemented for these species.	Not Applicable		No significant impacts are identified at the Specific Plan level.
	Harbison's Dun Skipper			
112	One hundred percent (or based on approved HCP/MSCP standards) of occupied habitat shall be preserved.	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Occupied habitat for Harbison's dun skipper does not occur with the Project Area or within offsite improvement areas.
				The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the standards established for this species.
113	The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts from proposed development and roads	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Habitat assessment conducted at Project-level and included in EIR.	Occupied habitat for Harbison's dun skipper does not occur with the Project Area or within offsite improvement areas
114	A mitigation plan shall be prepared and implemented for significant impacts. The following measures shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:	Not Applicable	TO STATE HOMOGEN IN LINE	No significant impacts are identified at the Specific Plan level
	<ul> <li>The project is designed to avoid impacts to occupied habitat.</li> <li>Preserve in natural open space all occupied habitat. Preserve in natural open space, high quality potential habitat (including all southern live oak riparian forest), and locations where the host plant, San Diego sedge (<i>Carex spissa</i>) occurs.</li> <li>Enhance as appropriate, unoccupied southern live oak riparian habitat in preserve areas through the introduction of San Diego sedge.</li> </ul>			
	<ul> <li>Incorporate a minimum of 75 percent of preserved habitat for this species into the Management Preserve.</li> <li>Maintain, and enhance as appropriate, the existing water quality and quantity in habitat preserved for this species.</li> </ul>			

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
115	A management plan for this species shall be developed and implemented	Not Applicable		No significant impacts are identified at the Specific Plan level
	Hermes Copper			
116	One hundred percent (or approved HCP/MSCP standards) of occupied habitat for this species shall be preserved.	Applicable	Satisfied. Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency.	Based on focused survey results, occupied Hermes copper butterfly habitat does not occur within the Development Footprint or within offsite improvement areas. See Biological Resources Report, EIR Appendix 2.4-1.
				The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the s standards established for this species.
117	<ul> <li>At the Specific Plan level, the Applicant shall conduct focused surveys for this species in appropriate habitat.</li> <li>The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts from proposed development and roads.</li> <li>A mitigation plan for significant impacts shall be prepared and implemented. The following measures shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:</li> </ul>	Applicable	Satisfied: Habitat assessment and focused surveys conducted at Project-level and included in project EIR, Section 2.4, Biological	Based on focused survey results, Hermes copper does not occur within the Development Footprint or within offsite improvements areas.
	<ul> <li>The project is designed to avoid impacts to occupied habitat.</li> <li>Where appropriate, implement mitigation for this species in conjunction with mitigation for other species.</li> <li>A management plan for this species shall be developed and implemented.</li> </ul>		Resources	Suitable habitat for this species will be conserved within the RMP Preserve.
	Thorne's Hairstreak			
118	One hundred percent (or approved HCP/MSCP standards) of occupied habitat shall be preserved	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Habitat for Thorne's hairstreak does not occur within the Development Footprint or within offsite improvement areas.
				The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the standards established for this species.
119	At the Specific Plan level, the Applicant shall conduct focused surveys for this species in appropriate habitat.  The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts from proposed development and roads.  A mitigation plan for significant impacts shall be prepared and implemented. The following measures shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Habitat assessment and focused surveys conducted at Project-level and included in EIR, Section 2.4,	Habitat for Thorne's hairstreak does not occur within the Development Footprint or within offsite improvement areas.
	<ul> <li>The project is designed to avoid impacts to occupied habitat.</li> <li>Preserve in natural open space all occupied habitat and potential habitat in Tecate cypress stands.</li> <li>A Fire Management Plan shall be prepared and implemented to prevent catastrophic wildfire destruction of the larval host, Tecate</li> </ul>		Biological Resources.	
	cypress. The fire control measures should include as a minimum, the following measures:  Prohibition of recreational off-road vehicle activity in the San Ysidro parcel.  Restriction of camp fires to designated areas.			
	<ul> <li>Banning of gun shooting in the San Ysidro parcel.</li> <li>Development of a public wildfire education and prevention program.</li> <li>Development and implementation of a program for conducting controlled burns.</li> </ul>			
	A management plan for this species shall be developed and implemented.			

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Quino Checkerspot			
120	One hundred percent (or approved HCP/MSCP standards) of occupied habitat for this species shall be preserved.	Applicable	Based on focused survey results, the Project Area is not occupied by Quino checkerspot butterfly. Further satisfied by Updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	Based on focused survey results, the Project Area is not occupied by Quino checkerspot butterfly.  Nevertheless, the project applicant shall consult – either directly or through the acting federal agency – with the USFWS to determine if incidental take authorization is required under the federal ESA. Should such take authorization be required, the applicant shall comply with all terms and conditions imposed by USFWS. (M-BI-8, M-BI-9, M-BI-10)
121	At the Specific Plan level, the Applicant shall conduct focused surveys for this species in appropriate habitat.  The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts from proposed development and roads.  A mitigation plan for significant impacts shall be prepared and implemented. The following measures shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:  The project is designed to avoid impacts to occupied habitat.  Preserve in natural open space all occupied habitat.  Preserve historical habitat in conjunction with mitigation for other species (e.g., Streptocephalus woottoni).  Introduce into vernal pools where appropriate, native Plantago species, the larval hosts for Quino checkerspot.  A management plan for this species shall be developed and implemented.	Applicable	Replaced by Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR. Habitat assessment and focused surveys conducted at Project-level and included in EIR, Section 2.4, Biological Resources	Based on focused survey results, Quino checkerspot does not occur within the Project Area or within offsite improvements areas.  Although there are no direct or indirect impacts to habitat occupied by Quino checkerspot butterfly, as a condition of the Proposed Project, a long-term Quino Checkerspot Butterfly Management/ Enhancement Plan will be prepared prior to the issuance of the first grading permit that impacts suitable habitat.  Additional mitigation includes preservation of suitable habitat within onsite and offsite RMP Preserve areas. (M-BI-8, M-BI-9, M-BI-10)
	California Red-legged Frog			Di 0, M Di 0, M Di 10)
122	One hundred percent (or approved HCP/MSCP standards) of occupied habitat shall be preserved	Applicable	Satisfied: Accomplished through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	Habitat for red-legged frog does not occur within the Development Footprint or within offsite improvement areas.  The Proposed Project conforms to the RMP/MSCP Preserve design upon which the species-specific preservation standards were based; therefore, the Proposed Project complies with the standards established for this preside.
123	At the Specific Plan level, (affecting occupied habitat for these species), the Applicant shall conduct focused surveys for this species in appropriate habitat.  The Applicant shall assess direct and indirect impacts from proposed development and roads.	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Habitat Assessment conducted at Project- level and included in project level EIR.	for this species.  Habitat for red-legged frog does not occur within the Development Footprint or within offsite improvement areas.



				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
124	<ul> <li>A mitigation plan shall be prepared and implemented for significant impacts. The following measures shall be incorporated into the mitigation plan:</li> <li>Preserve in natural open space all occupied habitat</li> <li>Preserve in open space, as feasible, potential aquatic habitat.</li> <li>Enhance or restore as appropriate, disturbed wetlands adjacent to occupied habitat and in the Otay River, to mitigate for indirect impacts to occupied habitat and impacts to potential habitat.</li> <li>Restore or enhance currently disturbed aquatic habitat prior to impacting potential aquatic habitat.</li> <li>Preserve in open space, buffer zones around occupied, potential, and restored habitats. The minimum width of the buffer zone shall be determined at the Specific Plan level in conjunction with, and upon the approval of, the resource agencies. Retain connectivity between upland habitats, identified as essential at the Specific Plan level for this species, and adjacent occupied, potential, and restored aquatic habitats.</li> <li>Preserve occupied and potential upland nesting habitat for Southwestern Pond Turtles which is adjacent to occupied, potential, or restored aquatic habitat.</li> <li>A management plan shall be developed and implemented for these species. Provisions shall be made for controlling introduced predators of these species (e.g., bullfrog and large-mouth bass).</li> </ul>	Not Applicable		No significant impacts are identified at the Specific Plan level.
	Significant Effect: Forty-nine (49) other sensitive wildlife species may be impacted. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.4-5 through 4.9.4-7]			
125	Detailed studies shall be required at the Specific Plan level to determine distribution and abundance. Assessment of impacts, preparation and implementation of mitigation for significant impacts shall also be required for those species found to occur onsite.  • Preserve habitat in open space (see page 3.3-108).  • Incorporate open space into the Management Preserve (see page 3.3-108).  • Restore/enhance disturbed habitat (see page 3.3-108).	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, regulatory compliance with the RMP and MSCP and/or updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Habitat Assessments and focused surveys for sensitive species conducted at Project -level and included in EIR, Section 2.4, Biological Resources and measures incorporated into the Project level EIR.	<ul> <li>Habitat preserved according to RMP/MSCP. (M-BI-3)</li> <li>RMP Preserve lands to be conveyed to the Otay Ranch POM. (M-BI-3)</li> <li>Restoration and enhancement to be provided as mitigation for areas temporarily impacted and for impacts to populations of sensitive plant species subject to the requirements of the BMO and RMP. (M-BI-11, M-BI-13)</li> </ul>
126	See Table 6 (from FPEIR), which follows. It should be noted that the reference to the MSCP/HCP in the minimum preservation also includes other appropriate regional standards.	Applicable	Achieved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency, regulatory compliance with the RMP and MSCP and/or updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. See EIR Chapter 2.4 and Appendix 2.4-1. Surveys were conducted in preparation of Appendix 2.4-1.	The Project biologist reviewed the species listed in Table 6 and determined that the Project complies with the requirements therein. The EIR covers the applicable species listed in Table 6. The project-level EIR included preparation of site-specific surveys, analysis and mitigation measures where necessary to address applicable species. The Project is consistent with, and would implement the MSCP and RMP, including the design of the RMP/MSCP Preserve which conserves habitat and species occurrences. By following the guidelines of the Otay Ranch RMP and conveying the agreed-upon acreage to the Otay Ranch RMP Preserve through M-BI-3 and additional habitat through M-BI-4, the Proposed Project would mitigate impacts to less than significant. With these measures, the Proposed Project would contribute to Ranch-wide conservation goals. The RMP serves as the management plan and is implemented in coordination with the Preserve Owner Manager and land steward.

	T	T	1	Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otav Ranch)		Method	Discussion
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)  Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	The 49 other sensitive species referenced herein are addressed in the EIR Chapter 2.4 and Appendix 2.4-1.  Specifically: Six MSCP covered species were observed in the Project Area; San Diego horned lizard, Southern California rufous-crowned sparrow, American badger, Northern harrier, Cooper's hawk, Golden eagle. Ten non-covered species were observed in the Project Area. Western spadefoot toad, San Diego whiptail, Silvery legless lizard, coastal rosy boa, Northern red diamond rattlesnake, California horned lark, Loggerhead shrike, Yellow warbler, short -eared owl, San Diego black-tailed jackrabbit. The remaining 33 species were not observed in the Project Area and include: Arroyo southwestern toad, San Diego banded gecko, Granite night lizard, Coronado skink, Orange-throated whiptail, San Diego ringneck snake, Coast patch-nosed snake, San Diego mountain kingsnake, two striped garter snake, mountain plover, long billed curlew, Burrowing owl, Short-eared owl, Southwestern willow flycatcher, yellow breasted chat, Bell's Sage sparrow, California leaf-nosed bat, Townsend's big-eared bat, Pallid bat, California mastiff bat, Pacific little pocket mouse, Northwestern San Diego pocket mouse, Dulzura California pocket mouse, Southern grasshopper mouse, San Diego desert woodrat, Osprey, Sharp-shinned
				hawk, Ferruginous hawk, Merlin, Prairie falcon, Spotted bat, Pocketed free-tailed bat, Big free-tailed bat.
	Significant Effect: Regional raptor-foraging areas would be impacted. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 3.3-48 through 3.3-51]	<u> </u>		Bat, 1 outclou neo-tailed bat, big nee-tailed bat.
127	Key raptor resource areas in proposed open space shall be preserved in accordance with the Otay Ranch Raptor Management Study (Ogden 1992a).	Applicable	Satisfied: Achieved through ranchwide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP standards.	The stated purpose of the RMP 1 was to design a preserve to maximize opportunities for multiple-species habitat management and protection. (M-BI-3, M-BI-4) The RMP includes Policy 2.11, which states, "Preserve habitat for raptor nesting, roosting, and foraging" and has an associated Guideline: "Incorporate into the Preserve areas that support raptor populations as identified in the Raptor Habitat/Foraging Study" (Ogden 1992). The Ogden study recommends preservation of these key resource areas "to the greatest extent feasible".  The RMP Preserve boundary for the Proposed Project is consistent with the approved Otay Ranch GDP/SRP, therefore, given that the RMP was drafted to be internally consistent, the approved development boundary incorporates the key resources areas from the Ogden study to the greatest extent feasible and Incorporation of any more of the key resource areas (the difference between Figure 10 of the Ogden study and the RMP hard line) was considered infeasible.

**DUDEK** 

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		·
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
				The Proposed Project's compliance with this mitigation measure is further supported by the golden eagle habitat and nesting studies conducted by H.T. Harvey & Associates, which are attached as appendices to the Project EIR.
128	The restoration/enhancement of nesting and foraging habitat shall be required. Standards for preservation are defined in Table 3.3-7 of the FPEIR and are as follows:  Preserve a majority of the key raptor nesting and foraging areas presented in the Otay Ranch Raptor Management Study.  The following areas are identified as key raptor habitat (sec Figure 10 in the raptor study):  1. Otay River Valley (including the slopes).  2. Salt Creek Canyon  3. Johnson Canyon and Otay Mesa  4. Wolf Canyon  5. Poggi Canyon and Telegraph Avenue  6. North end of Proctor Valley  7. Central Proctor Valley and the adjacent slopes to the east  8. Lower southwest slopes of Jamul Mountains  9. Disjunct parcel west of the lower end of Upper Otay Lake  10. Canyon southeast of Buschalaugh Cove and the area cast of Lower Otay Lake Dam  11. Western San Ysidro parcel below south shore of Lower Otay Lake and Dulzura Creek  12. Little Cedar Canyon  13. Hubbard Springs (southern live oak riparian forest and sycamore alluvial woodland)  14. Cedar Canyon	See above for preservation and below for enhancement	Satisfied: Foraging habitat sufficiently conserved through ranch-wide RMP Preserve design consistency and MSCP as documented in Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1).	See above for preservation and below for enhancement. Portions of areas 6 and 7 identified in the Mitigation Measure are located within designated Otay Ranch RMP Preserve and will not be impacted by the Proposed Project. As previously stated, the approved development boundary incorporates the key resources areas from the Ogden study to the greatest extent feasible. (M-BI-3, M-BI-4)  Note also that some of the raptor species to which the 1993 PEIR refers, such as golden eagle, subsequently became "covered species" under the MSCP adopted in the 1998. The proposed Project is consistent with the MSCP and complies with the raptor-related protective/ conservation measures set forth therein and later included in the County's ESA section 10a incidental take permit.
129	15. Area adjacent to offsite Sycamore Canyon in the San Ysidro parcel  Depending on which and how much of the key raptor areas are preserved, the enhancement of additional areas for foraging and nesting habitat could be required at the Specific Plan level to reduce impacts to below significance. Areas recommended for restoration are identified in the Otay	Applicable	Satisfied: Foraging habitat sufficiently conserved through ranch-wide RMP	The areas described for grassland restoration are outside of the Project Area (southwestern slopes of the Jamul
	Ranch Raptor Management Study and include:  a. Native grassland restoration for foraging. Potential restoration sites include:  • NNG on Otay Mesa south and west of vernal pools. Portions of suitable AG lands on mesa north of Otay River Valley.  • The lower southwest slopes of the Jamul Mountains adjacent to vernal pools  b. Cliff Nest Enhancement Sites include:		Preserve design consistency and MSCP as documented in Biological Resources Report, (EIR Appendix 2.4-1).	Mountains).  The cliff nest enhancement site is located outside of the Project Area.
	<ul> <li>East of Lower Otay Dam</li> <li>Southeast corner of the Proctor Valley parcel</li> <li>Tree Nest Enhancement Areas include:</li> <li>Appropriate ravines and canyons throughout the three parcels (enhance with sycamore, oak, willow, and cottonwood tree species).</li> </ul>			Areas identified for tree nest enhancement include drainages – some of which occur within Planning Areas 16/19. The only trees located within the Project Area include eucalyptus woodland and southern coast live oak riparian forest. Neither of these habitats will be impacted onsite. A small area of eucalyptus woodland would temporarily be impacted by off-site improvements associated with Proctor Valley Road. However, since this vegetation community is not considered sensitive, no mitigation is provided. (M-BI-3, M-BI-4)

				Compliance	
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion	
131	Prepare and implement a long-term raptor management plan for raptors on Otay Ranch. This plan should be based on the recommendations of the Otay Ranch Raptor Management Study. It should also include as appropriate any other management techniques which become available and are applicable for the raptor population on Otay Ranch. The management plan should include provisions for periodic long-term monitoring of onsite raptor populations to determine their status and the appropriateness of management techniques. The goal of the management program shall be to maintain and where feasible enhance preserved raptor populations.	Applicable	Implementation of RMP, MSCP, and Preserve Owners/Manager management activities of the POM. The long-term raptor management plan will be prepared by the POM in accordance with the RMP requirements.	Specific recommendations for the Raptor Management Plan include four components:  1. Population Monitoring: Recommendation #1 is a POM activity.  2. Habitat Enhancement: Habitat enhancement as described in the Raptor Management Study is not feasible for the Proposed Project. The Proposed Project will result in marginal impacts to suitable raptor nesting habitat. The study suggests revegetating portions of Proctor Valley with native trees to provide nesting opportunities. This would require changing native habitats which currently exist within the Project Area and therefore is not feasible. In addition, the POM is responsible for habitat enhancement.  3. Protection of Raptor Habitat from Human Disturbance: Recommendation #3 specifically states that a 3,000-foot buffer zone should be established around all known historic and active golden eagle nests, which was incorporated into the MSCP as a 4,000-foot buffer, with which the project complies.  4. Development of an Environmental Awareness Program: Recommendation 4 is POM activity. Signage and fencing will be placed around the Proposed Development in accordance with the Preserve Edge Plan.	
	Significant Effect: Regional and local wildlife corridors would be impacted. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.4-8 through 4.9.4-9]				
132	The project is designed to maintain connectivity of the parcels and adjacent blocks of offsite open space.	Applicable	Satisfied: Achieved through Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and RMP design consistency.	The RMP Preserve boundary for the Proposed Project is consistent with the approved Otay Ranch GDP/SRP.	
133	<ul> <li>Specific mitigation for all corridors shall follow detailed recommendations from the Otay Ranch Wildlife Corridor Study (Ogden 1992b). The following general recommendations apply to all regional and important local wildlife corridors.</li> <li>Preserved wildlife corridors shall be retained as natural open space, contain native vegetation, and be used for only passive recreation.</li> <li>All road underpasses and bridges crossing wildlife corridors shall have natural vegetation underneath and be sufficiently wide to encourage wildlife use.</li> <li>Wildlife corridors through development shall be sufficiently wide to encompass the natural rim to rim topography and allow undisturbed wildlife movement.</li> <li>Incompatible land uses (e.g. high density residential development and roads) shall not be sited adjacent to wildlife corridors, not including the buffer, (development within the buffer shall not be allowed).</li> </ul>	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete: Project-level design and documented in project Biological Resource Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1) follow the recommendations of the referenced Odgen study.	Design at the Project-level incorporates all four the recommendations of the Otay Ranch Wildlife Corridor Study. Specifics regarding wildlife corridors and crossings associated with the Proposed Project are provided in the Biological Resources Report, Sections 4.8, 5.5 and 9 (EIR Appendix 2.4-1). (M-BI3-3)	
134	The following measures shall be implemented for the Otay River parcel: Impacts from road construction to the four regional corridors in the Otay River parcel shall be mitigated by road design and realignment following the Wildlife Corridor Study recommendations.  (specific measure not included because they do not apply to the project)	Not Applicable		Measure applies to Otay Valley Parcel. The Proposed Project is within the Proctor Valley Parcel.	

					Compliance
			Applicable to Proposed		
10-		Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
135	The fo	Corridor R1 - (see Figure 3.37 in the FPEIR) - In the disjunct L-shaped parcel, low density development shall be pulled west out of the ravine and well back on the ridge so that animals may access the ravine, which leads them northwest over the saddle and into the Sweetwater Reservoir. The corridor shall be 1600 feet wide at the mouth of this ravine, with at least 500 feet of open space along the southwest side of the mouth of this ravine.	Applicable	Satisfied/Complete. Addressed in Project-level EIR, Project Design and Regulatory Compliance with the RMP.	1. Development in the inverted L portion of Village 14 (not a part of the Proposed Project), was eliminated from the ravine and pulled back onto the ridgetop so that animals could access the ravine, which leads them northwest over the saddle and into the Sweetwater Reservoir. It should be noted that the majority of the "inverted L" parcels has been purchased by third parties for conservation and restoration.
	2.	In Proctor Valley, the corridor shall widen from 1300 feet at the northwest end to 2200 feet at the southeast end. Development east of Proctor Valley Road shall be pulled back on the south side of the corridor. The K through 6 elementary school may be within the buffer if the playing fields are adjacent to the corridor, there is no lighting or activity at night, and appropriate fencing is maintained. Low density development west of Proctor Valley Road shall be moved north out of the corridor Revegetation and screening from development shall be required in the Proctor Valley portion of the corridor. The Proctor Valley Road crossing shall be bridged (See Wildlife Corridor Study).			2. Corridor R1 was designed to become an extensive linkage, with the required minimum of 1,300 feet at the northwest end to 2,200 feet at the southeast end, resulting in protection of rim-to-rim topography. The corridor ranges from approximately 1,600 feet wide to almost 2,600 feet wide where it passes through the Project Area. The corridor was pulled back as noted in Chula Vista RMP 2 Figure 3.
	3.	The corridor follows the deep canyon east of Proctor Valley and shall include rim to rim topography. It is approximately 1600 feet wide. Low density development extending into the canyon on the north side of the corridor shall be pulled back onto the ridgetops. Where delineation of rim to rim topography is not obvious, there shall be 800 feet of width in open space extending up each side of the ravine.			3. All of the proposed housing along the ridgetop above the lake at the southerly entrance to Proctor Valley, and the southernmost portions of the proposed development bubble in central Proctor Valley, were eliminated to reduce impacts to coastal sage and the local wildlife corridor from Jamul Mountain to Proctor Valley. See #2 for corridor width.
	4.	Local Corridor 4 - To eliminate impacts by Proctor Valley Road to local Corridor 4, Proctor Valley Road shall be elevated across ravines along its alignment to allow for wildlife movement underneath and into the alternate corridor in the creekbed to the north of Proctor Valley Road.			4. The local corridor L4 is located to the east of PV1 and to the west of other Village 14 development. The Ogden Wildlife Corridor Study states that this corridor is 500 to 700 feet wide (Ogden 1992b). As L4 passes through the western portion of development, the corridor is 800 to 900 feet wide. As the corridor passes across Proctor Valley Road at the northern end of the Project Area, the corridor ranges from 1,600 to 3,000 feet. Three wildlife crossing will be installed along Proctor Valley Road to allow for continued wildlife movement in this corridor.

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)  5. Corridor R2 - Low density and LMV development along the western site of this corridor shall be pulled back to retain rim to rim topography in open space. The corridor is approximately 1600 feet wide throughout the canyon. Low density development on a knoll on the east side of the corridor shall be eliminated as it encroaches into the corridor. At the south end of Corridor R2 near Otay Lakes Road, LMV and MH development shall be pulled back to the east and west respectively, to maintain a minimum width of 1600 feet. At the Otay Lakes Road crossing the corridor may narrow as recommended in the Wildlife Corridor Study. The proposed park at the south end of the corridor shall be designed at the Specific Plan level so as not to impact the corridor. It shall be sited within the buffer zone (moved east or west) and not relocated within the ravine. The two Otay Lake Road crossings of this corridor shall be bridged as recommended in the Otay Ranch Wildlife Corridor Study.	Project	Method	5. Corridor R2 is not located within the Project Area.  Specifics regarding wildlife corridors and crossings associated with the Proposed Project are provided in the Biological Resources Report, Sections 4.8, 5.5 and 9 (EIR Appendix 2.4-1).
136	The following measures shall be implemented in the San Ysidro parcel:	Not Applicable		Outside of project area
	(specific measure not included because they do not apply to the project)			
	Significant Cumulative Effects: Significantly decrease key biological resources in southwestern San Diego County. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p			
137	The cumulative effects shall be mitigated through a combination of measures which ultimately concentrate on protecting the key resource areas and tying these areas together onsite and with adjacent offsite areas to create a viable regional open space preserve (see Section VIII of the EIR). The key component of this mitigation is the Resource Management Plan (RMP), which establishes minimum standards to be achieved with the development of the Project.	Applicable	Achieved with regulatory compliance with the RMP and MSCP as well as Project specific mitigation measures as documented in the Project-level Biological Resources Report (EIR Appendix 2.4-1).	For the reasons set forth above, the Proposed Project complies with this mitigation requirement, and all other RMP requirements, as it relates to the project's contribution to cumulative impacts on biological resources.  The designated areas of the RMP Preserve within the Project Area are consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and incorporated into the RMP, Chula Vista MSCP Subarea Plan, MSCP County Subarea Plan, and Implementing Agreement. Specifically, the RMP Preserve within Village 14 is 270.2 acres, and the RMP Preserve within Planning Areas 16/19 totals 156.5 acres. These acreage comparisons show that the Proposed Project is consistent with the Preserve assumptions of the Chula Vista MSCP Subarea Plan, the MSCP County Subarea Plan, and the RMP. As further evidence of the Proposed Project's consistency with the MSCP County Subarea Plan, Proposed Project does not include a MSCP Preserve boundary adjustment as the Proposed Project would not encroach into the MSCP Preserve but would respect the original Preserve boundary presented in the RMP and the MSCP County Subarea Plan. (M-BI-3, M-BI-4)
138	Sensitive habitats on Otay Ranch shall be restored or preserved to provide mitigation for both the loss of habitat and sensitive species due to development of the property. Restoration of disturbed habitats will increase the resource value of the habitat, as well as potentially provide links to key resource areas on both local and regional levels. Habitat restoration in areas that connect two or more otherwise isolated key resource areas will allow migration between subpopulations resulting in more viable populations.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory compliance and updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into the Project level EIR.	Achieved through regulatory compliance. The Project will comply with the MSCP, BMO and RMP, including measures requiring salvage plans. (M-BI-3, M-BI-11)  With respect to the Proposed Project significant impacts on sensitive habitats, as determined by the Project EIR, such impacts would be mitigated consistent with this measure from the PEIR.  Specifically, the Proposed Project provides for the preservation of sensitive habitats and populations of sensitive species. This preservation contributes to the overall goals identified within the RMP.

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
139	Restoration of habitat in highly biodiverse areas can play an important role in effectively increasing the population size of sensitive species. Disturbed portions of the Otay River Valley will be restored back to an intact riparian habitat, which will allow for an increase in the number of least Bell's vireo breeding pairs that will utilize the expanded habitat. Restoration of Diegan coastal sage scrub habitats will potentially contribute to the maintenance of the California gnatcatcher population on Otay Ranch, and disturbed coastal sage scrub habitat adjacent to areas currently utilized by cactus wren could be restored with maritime succulent scrub in order for the cactus wren population to expand.	Not Applicable		The Coastal Sage Scrub restoration requirement was eliminated by County Board of Supervisors General Plan Amendment 06-012 and City Council Resolution 2006-155.  No areas identified for least Bell's vireo or Coastal Sage Scrub restoration are located within the Project Area.
	CULTURAL RESOURCES			<u> </u>
	Significant Effect: Disturbance of significant prehistoric and historic resources. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.5-8 through 4.9.5-9]			
140	Prehistoric Resources - A programmatic mitigation plan for prehistoric resources shall be prepared. The following plan is a synopsis of a more detailed program presented in the Resource Management Plan (RMP). (Details from the measure are not included for brevity).	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures included in Project-level EIR.	A Cultural Resources Report was prepared for the Proposed Project (EIR Appendix 2.5-1). See Mitigation Measures M-CR-1 through M-CR-3.
141	Historic Resources - Mitigation measures for historic resources are essentially the same as for prehistoric resources as described above. The same steps and stages should be followed although, as described in the RMP, archival research and historical documentation shall be used to augment field testing programs. Mitigation of impacts to historic resources through preservation may be more feasible for historic sites than for prehistoric sites because they generally comprise a smaller area and can often be synthesized into a development plan. Adaptive reuse of standing historic structures shall be required where feasible, and preservation plans to ensure long-term viability of the structures shall be required.	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures included in Project-level EIR.	Cultural Resources Technical Report prepared. Mitigation Measures recommended. See Mitigation Measures M-CR-1 through M-CR-3.
	If in situ (i.e, in place) preservation is not possible, recovery of all possible information, both surface and subsurface, is the only other acceptable alternative. The data recovery program will be integrated with a corresponding archival research program to fully assess the significance of the material found on the sites. By creating a complementary research program that fully incorporates the archival material with the field results, many important research questions can be addressed.			
142	Prehistoric/Historic Resources - Mitigation measures for prehistoric/historic resources are essentially the same as for prehistoric and historic resources as described above. The same steps and stages should be followed although, as described in the RMP, archival research and historical documentation may be used to augment field testing programs. (Details from the measure are not included for brevity).	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures included in Project-level EIR.	A Cultural Resources Report was prepared for the Proposed Project (EIR Appendix 2.5-1). See Mitigation Measures M-CR-1 through M-CR-3.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: The loss of approximately 75 percent of the known cultural resource sites in the combined cumulative study	dy area. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p.	6-26 through 6-29]	
143	A regional preservation plan with specific cultural resource preservation goals shall be established to determine what kind of database the managing agencies desire to retain after the region as a whole has been developed. Once a plan and goals have been established, a specific resource preservation plan developed by the Applicant for the Otay Ranch that focuses on database diversity in terms of values shall be established and implemented specifically for the Otay Ranch Project. This plan shall conform to regional preservation goals, establish realistic preservation measures that address secondary impacts and long-term preservation and access to the database.	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures included in Project-level EIR.	Parcel-wide evaluations replaced by project-specific studies. A Cultural Resources Report was prepared for the Proposed Project (EIR Appendix 2.5-1). Mitigation Measure M-CR-2b requires a Research Design and Data Recovery Program be implemented for significant inadvertent discoveries, M-CR-3 requires a Data Recovery Plan for two impacted cultural resources, and M-CR-2.f. requires the duration of any cultural materials at an appropriate facility, such as the San Diego Archaeological Center.
144	A regional repository shall be established and cultural material from the Project and the region shall be preserved in this repository. Furthermore, funding for its long-term preservation shall be secured to ensure preservation of the resources; the Applicant shall pay a fair share.	Applicable	Satisfied: Achieved through compliance with County standards.	The San Diego Archaeological Center is the standard curation facility in San Diego County. Curation of project artifacts at the San Diego County Archaeological Center would be funded by the Project applicant.

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	GEOLOGY AND SOILS			
	Significant Effect: Geology impacts include slope instability, development proposed on metavolcanic bedrock, and seismic hazards. S	oils impacts include expans	ve soils, erosion, and liquefaction.	FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.6-1]
145	At the tentative map level, site-specific geotechnical studies based on proposed development plans shall be conducted prior to construction to specifically evaluate soil conditions and characteristics, areas of potential slope instability, landslides, faults, liquefaction, and rippability characteristics. The studies shall be conducted by a qualified geotechnical engineer for the Project Applicant and shall meet the engineering standards of the appropriate jurisdiction. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.6-1]  Impacts related to slope instability shall be mitigated by site-specific geotechnical static and pseudo-static slope stability analyses conducted prior to submittal of tentative maps that will provide input relative to appropriate slope design alternatives. These mitigation measures shall include benching, adjusting heights and inclinations of proposed cut and fill slopes, retaining walls, slope protection, and/or erosion control devices.  Significant impacts due to ground rupture shall be avoided by not building directly over the fault trace. A site-specific geotechnical study would be necessary at the tentative map level to identify specific fault locations and delineate fault setback zones (as necessary) in accordance with city and/or county guidelines.  Potential damage from seismic ground shaking shall be mitigated by adhering to the Uniform Building Code, state-of-the-art seismic design parameters of the Structural Engineering Association of California (SEAOC), and applicable local building codes. Such seismic design suggests assuming a design ground acceleration that is equal to two-thirds of the maximum anticipated bedrock acceleration. The design acceleration for the Otay Ranch area is 0.18g. The seismic design parameters, provided as a result of a site-specific geotechnical study, shall be utilized by a qualified geotechnical engineering consultant shall perform an investigation of the site to evaluate the liquefaction potential upon submittal of tentative maps. Where potential for liquefaction is determi	Applicable expans	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	A Geotechnical Report (EIR Appendix 2.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project by Advanced Geotechnical Solutions, a qualified geotechnical engineer. The Geotechnical Report recommends measures to address slope stability, landslides, faults, liquefaction and rip ability. See Mitigation Measure M-GE-1 in EIR Section 2.6. Geology and Soils.
146	delineate the limits of slides (i.e., head and toe). Landslides which may potentially impact developed areas shall be completely removed or buttressed during site grading. However, basal erosion of the slopes shall be avoided. Oversaturation and subsequent loading of the soils and sediments (from lawns, etc.) shall be avoided.  At the tentative map level, onsite soils shall be investigated by a qualified geotechnical consultant to evaluate the potential for significant impacts due to erosion and expansion. Appropriate mitigation measures, such as those provided below, shall be incorporated into the Project	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation	A Geotechnical Report (EIR Appendix 2.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project by Advanced Geotechnical
	<u>Erosion</u> - Erosion shall be minimized through erosion control measures. During the construction phase, interim measures such as covering exposed graded slopes with visqueen and sandbagging at slope toes shall be implemented. During the operational phase, measures including maintenance of drought tolerant vegetative cover and vegetated buffer zones and appropriate drainage control devices shall be employed <u>Expansive Soils</u> - Problems related to expansive (shrink-swell) soils shall be mitigated by selective grading and specially designed foundations in compliance with the Uniform Building Code (UBC).		Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	Solutions, a qualified geotechnical engineer. The Geotechnical Report recommends measures to address erosion and expansive soils. See Mitigation Measure M-GE-1 in EIR Section 2.6., Geology and Soils.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: An increase in population and property that would be exposed to the effects of seismic ground shaking fro	m local active faults, such as	the Rose Canyon and Coronado Bank	faults. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-30]
147	Cumulative impacts related to seismic ground shaking shall be avoided by designing and constructing proposed projects in accordance with the Uniform Building Code (UBC), state-of-the-art seismic design parameters of the Structural Engineering Association of California (SEAOC), and applicable local building codes as required by local agencies. No additional measures are necessary for seismic effects.	Applicable	Satisfied: Achieved through regulatory compliance.	EIR Section 2.6, Geology and Soils, determined that impacts due to ground shaking, including cumulative impacts, would be less than significant through compliance with the Uniform Building Code.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
148	All significant cumulative geologic and soil impacts shall be mitigated through appropriate site-specific investigations and implementation of standard construction and design methods as described in Section VIII of the FPEIR.	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures. addressed at the Project-level EIR.	A Geotechnical Report (EIR Appendix 2.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project by Advanced Geotechnical Solutions, a qualified geotechnical engineer The Study recommends measures to address site specific geologic and soils impacts. See Mitigation Measure M-GE-1 in EIR Section 2.6., Geology and Soils.
	PALEONTOLOGICAL RESOURCES			
	Significant Effect: Disturbance of paleontological resources. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p.4.9.7-1]			
149	Prior to issuance of development permits, the Applicant shall confirm to the City of Chula Vista or the County of San Diego that a qualified paleontologist has been retained to carry out an appropriate mitigation program. (A qualified paleontologist is defined as an individual with a M.S. or Ph.D. in paleontology or geology who is familiar with paleontological procedures and techniques.) A pre-grade meeting shall be held amongst the paleontologist and the grading and excavation contractors.	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	A Paleontological Resources Study (EIR Appendix 2.10-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project and recommends Measure M-PR-1 which requires a qualified paleontologist be retained to perform mitigation for potential impacts to paleontological resources.
	(Details are not included for brevity)  AGRICULTURAL RESOURCES			
	AGRICULTURAL RESOURCES			
	Significant Effect: Conversion of prime farmlands and elimination of existing crop production. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.8-1 through p. 4.9	.8-2]		
150	In the Otay River parcel near the proposed composting facilities and Bird Ranch where prime soils are located, a demonstration agricultural area shall be set aside. Schools proposed within the Otay Ranch property shall be allowed to promote educational activities in regard to agriculture through the use of the demonstration agricultural area. A possible location for the demonstration area would be in the southwest portion of the Otay River parcel. This area is considered suitable since it contains prime agricultural soils and is designated as a regional park in the Project. Development of this area shall be within the proposed park. The size and exact location of the demonstration agricultural area shall be determined at the Specific Plan level. The criteria to establish the demonstration agricultural activities shall include the following: I) the demonstration area must be located within an area of the park containing prime farmland soils, and 2) its location shall not conflict with sensitive biological or cultural resources.	Not Applicable		This measure applies to the Otay Valley Parcel. The Project area is within the Proctor Valley Parcel.
151	Agricultural activity and the keeping of animals shall be allowed within the large, low density lots planned along the northern edge of the Proctor Valley parcel, as allowed within the Jamul-Dulzura Subregional Plan. Development plans for this area shall contain landscaping and buffering requirements designed to prevent nuisance impacts related to noise and odor, from occurring between adjacent internal residential uses.	Applicable	Satisfied: Implemented by the Specific Plan Development Regulations.	The Specific Plan, Chapter IV, Development Regulations includes the Rural Residential (RR) Zoning Box which indicates Animal Regulation "L" which allows keeping of animals. Limited Agricultural uses are permitted within Planning Areas 16/19 subject to CC&R regulations which to address nuisance impacts on adjacent residential uses.
	Significant Effect: Inconsistency with existing County of San Diego and City of Chula Vista plans and policies and State policies. [FPEIR			
152	An Agricultural Plan shall be prepared by the Project Applicant prior to approval of any SPA Plans affecting onsite agricultural resources and shall be required for each subsequent development proposal (i.e., villages, Town Center, the Eastern Town Center, and the Rural Estate Planned Community). The Plan shall indicate the type of agricultural activity allowed as an interim use. Specifications shall include buffering guidelines designed to prevent potential land use interface impacts related to noise, odors, dust, insects, rodents, and chemicals that may accompany agricultural activities and operations. Adequate buffering shall be provided between the proposed development area and the interim agricultural use. Buffering measures shall include:  1) a 200-foot distance between property boundaries and agricultural operations;  2) if permitted interim agricultural uses require the use of pesticide, then limits shall be set as to the time of day and the type of pesticide application that may occur;  3) use of vegetation along the field edges adjacent to development that can be used for shielding (i.e., com); and  4) notification of adjacent property owners of potential pesticide applications; and  (5) use of fencing. The plan shall be reviewed by the city or county planning department that has jurisdiction over these areas to verify that the	Applicable	Satisfied: Implemented by the Agricultural Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 8).	There are no ongoing or adjacent agricultural operations.  See Agricultural Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 8).

				Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	Significant Effect: Land use interface impacts associated with agricultural activities and urban uses. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.8-2]			
153	Landscaping and buffering guidelines shall be included in the development plans at the SPA plan level for the areas planned adjacent to existing agricultural uses. These areas include the eastern edges of the Proctor Valley parcel and the northern edges of the San Ysidro parcel where estate residential uses would be developed near the Daley Ranch agricultural activities (i.e., crop cultivation and cattle ranging).	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project does not propose development adjacent to existing agricultural uses.
	MINERAL RESOURCES	1		
	Significant Effect: Potential loss of mineral resources of economic value due to development or land use conflict. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4]	/ Q Q_11		
154	Compatible land uses shall be developed near the locations of future mineral extraction activities. If feasible, Project phasing shall allow for the	Not Applicable		The Project Area is not located near any existing or future
104	extraction of mineral resources at Rock Mountain, the Nelson and Sloan quarry and the Daley quarry before conflicting development occurs.	Not Applicable		mineral extraction activities or the locations identified in the measure (i.e., Rock Mountain, Nelson and Sloan quarry or Daley quarry). Mineral extraction is not proposed by the Proposed Project or adjacent to the Project Area.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Loss of aggregate mineral resources. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-35 through 6-36]			Troposed Project of adjacent to the Project Area.
155	Project phasing in the San Ysidro and Proctor Valley parcels shall allow for mineral extraction before conflicting development occurs, if feasible.	Not Applicable		As determined in EIR Section 3.1.4, Mineral Resources, no
100	1 Toject phasing in the earl 1 state and 1 Toctor valley parcels shall allow for militeral extraction before conflicting development occurs, if reasible.	Not Applicable		significant, minable mineral resources would be impacted by the Proposed Project.
156	Compatible land uses shall be developed in areas where mineral extraction would likely occur.	Not Applicable		The Project Area is not located near any existing or future mineral extraction activities or the locations identified in the measure. Mineral extraction is not proposed by the Proposed Project.
	WATER RESOURCES AND WATER QUALITY			
	Cincificant Effects Increase in conference of due to an increase in important conference and increase actantial for decomplete.	landing any and activities afet	vimposta and increase areais a and al	Mation IEDEID Volume 2 m 4 0 40 41
157	Significant Effect: Increases in surface water runoff due to an increase in impervious surfaces could increase potential for downstream f			
157	The Applicant for the first SPA shall prepare a comprehensive drainage infrastructure plan for the drainage basin as defined by the appropriate jurisdiction. The master drainage plans for each drainage basin shall be developed with the first SPA within each drainage basin. The specific master drainage plans shall include drainage infrastructure, staging/development detail, timing, financing, and responsibility for drainage impacts. The master drainage plans shall comply with Title 44 of the Code of Federal Regulations in regard to development on floodplains. In addition, the master drainage plans shall comply with County of. San Diego protection ordinances regarding the floodway and floodplain fringe wetlands or with Chula Vista ordinances. Any channel improvements on a watershed greater than one (1) square mile shall comply with Section 404 of the Clean Water Act.  The impacts associated with inundation shall be quantified by hydrologic and hydraulic studies by a qualified hydrologist for the Project Applicant at the SPA	Applicable  Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.  Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-	The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1) and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These plans were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego Hydrology Manual, County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. The Major Storm Water Management Plan details the design and location of bioretention/hydromodification basins at each outlet of developed areas of the property. The Drainage Study details peak discharges at every outlet, including each culvert within the Project. The hydromodification basins detailed in the Major Storm Water Management Plan are designed to mitigate all post development flow volumes to predevelopment levels.  The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1)
	Plan level when a detailed development plan is available. The hydraulic studies shall demonstrate that the Project design meets Title 44 of the Code of Federal Regulations and the County of San Diego and City of Chula Vista floodplain encroachment and engineering standards contained in the appropriate ordinances of each jurisdiction. The recommendations of these studies shall be implemented in order to mitigate impacts. The studies shall include:  A detailed site-specific floodplain/floodway width study shall be completed at the tentative map stage to ensure that encroachment of the floodway is avoided. The floodplain fringe may be developed in certain areas if a retaining structure (e.g., dike, etc.) is built at the floodway boundary. Under the supervision of the Public Works Department of the appropriate agency, the Applicant shall conduct a detailed design study for each bridge and culvert. All proposed bridges and culverts shall be designed and constructed for the 100-year flood without causing backwater effects	''	level EIR and technical studies.	and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These plans were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego Hydrology Manual, County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. The study includes a (HEC RAS) river analysis to determine the expected limits of the 100-year inundation elevation to ensure that encroachment is avoided and to preliminarily

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
159	The Otay Ranch development shall not increase existing 100-year flood flows above natural conditions unless downstream structures can accommodate the increase in total discharge, peak discharge, and increased velocities, or the Applicant constructs required detention basins to prevent adverse impacts	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	The EIR includes a Drainage Study prepared for the proposed project shows and increase in runoff from the developed portion of the property to be less than 6%. This is small portion of the overall watershed tributary to the Otay Reservoir. The Reservoir is owned by the City of San Diego and they have reviewed the CEQA Drainage Study and supported increases in flows to the reservoir as long as they have been cleaned per RWQCB Order R9-2013-0001."
160	At the SPA plan level, the impacts associated with change in water velocities shall be addressed by detailed hydrologic and hydraulic studies prepared by a qualified hydrologist. These studies shall discuss erosion and sedimentation of the Project development and specifically how these i mpacts shall be avoided through design features in accordance with Title 44 of the Code of Federal Regulations and City of Chula Vista and County of San Diego erosion control standards. The recommendations of these studies shall be implemented.  The Applicant shall protect all embankments and slopes within the floodplain to prevent erosion.  Energy dissipation devices shall be necessary at the confluences of the storm drainage system and the natural channels to prevent erosion.  Siltation basins shall be necessary at locations where the runoff velocity drastically decreases.		Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	The Drainage Study prepared for the Proposed Project provides measures to address erosion along the floodway path via installation of slope stabilization, energy dissipation, rip rap, and sediment basins.
161	Potential water quality problems shall be mitigated by implementing the plans provided in the Urban Runoff/Reservoir Study. These plans include a dry weather system to collect all dry weather urban runoff, spills, and approximately 25 percent of rain runoff (the first flush). The first flush would contain a large majority of the urban pollutants. The Project plans shall also include a water monitoring program to check the effectiveness of the system. As indicated in Table 3.9-5 of the Final Program EIR, the salt modeling by Wilson Engineering shows that this procedure would be effective in reducing urban pollution to a level similar to existing conditions prior to urbanization. This level shall meet the Primary Drinking Water standards, which would in turn maintain quality for the beneficial uses of the lake, including recreation and fisheries. All systems shall be designed so that in the case of pipe failure the effluent is adequately captured. The Applicant shall create buffer zones around the lakes. The buffer zones shall consider the predicted volume of runoff, predicted pollutant concentrations, and appropriate vegetation type.		Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies. Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	The Project-level EIR includes a comprehensive analysis of water quality issues and requirements. Design of the project and facilities related to drainage and water quality controls are consistent with the Drainage Plan, but incorporates more contemporary requirements of the County, the State and the City of San Diego, including the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual, San Diego County Hydromodification Management Plan, and City of San Diego Source Water Protection Guidelines.
	The Applicant must comply with all applicable regulations established by the United States Environmental Protection Agency as set forth in the National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit requirements for urban runoff and stormwater discharge and any regulations adopted by the City of Chula Vista or County of San Diego pursuant thereto. The City of Chula Vista and County of San Diego have a Municipal Permit from the State Regional Water Quality Control Board (RWCQB) for stormwater discharge. In order to be covered under a Municipal Permit, Order No. 90-42, NPDES No. CA0108758, the developed area shall be required to mitigate impacts to stormwater quality. Further measures that are more strict than the permit standards, however, shall be imposed if necessary to reduce the impact below a level of significance after appropriate site-specific studies at the Specific Plan level.  In addition, the RWQCB has issued one general permit that applies to construction activity. In order to be covered under the Construction General Permit, a Notice of Intent (NOI) must be filed with the RWQCB. Compliance with the Permit requires that a stormwater pollution prevention plan be prepared and implemented for the Project.			Per the Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2), the Proposed Project must comply with the San Diego Region (RWQCB) Order No. R9-2013-001 (MS4) requirements for storm water management. The Plan addresses the post construction permanent BMPs necessary for local compliance and considers its respective drainage watershed and its significant pollutants of concern. In addition, the Plan in part provides preliminary guidance of expected construction-phase BMPS needed to comply with the State's Construction General Permit (Order No. 2009-DWQ). A Stormwater Pollution Prevention Plan (SWPPP) will be required to be developed during the construction phase of the project as
	Best management practices, design, treatment, and monitoring for stormwater quality must be addressed with respect to Municipal and Construction Permits.			part of the process for final development permitting.
	Detailed stormwater quality studies shall be conducted by a qualified hydrologic engineer at the SPA Plan level to develop appropriate mitigations that protect the quality of both the Otay Reservoirs and the remaining waterways. The stormwater quality studies shall demonstrate that no degradation of water quality will occur			

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
162	Potential significant decreases in recharge to the aquifer system shall be mitigated by utilizing unlined natural channels and unlined siltation basins. Prior to SPA plan approval, a study shall be prepared by a qualified hydrogeologic engineer. Such study shall address the issues of manmade recharge systems. The study shall identify the appropriate recommendations to be implemented during Project buildout in order to mitigate possible aquifer recharge impacts. The study shall demonstrate that the City of Chula Vista or County of San Diego standards on aquifer recharge shall be achieved	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the EIR Section 3.1.2, Hydrology and Water Quality and technical studies.	The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1) and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These plans were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001 which require infiltration to the extent the existing soils are permeable. All developed portions of the site flow into bioretention basins. All bioretention basins located in areas where the existing soils are permeable and conducive to ground water recharge are unlined and designed to provide infiltration. Ground water recharge is not impacted within natural channels outside the Project Development Footprint.
	Significant Effect: Development may encroach into the 100-year floodplain. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.10-1]	_		
163	The development of permanent structures for human habitation or as a place of work shall not be permitted in a floodway. Uses permitted in a floodway shall be limited to agricultural, recreational, and other such low-intensity uses provided, however, that no use shall be permitted which will substantially harm the environmental values of a particular floodway area. Mineral resources extraction shall be permitted subject to any necessary approvals, provided that mitigation measures are required which produce any net gain in the functional wetlands and Riparian habitat	Not Applicable		The Project Area is outside of designated 100- and 500- year floodplain areas and other special flood hazard areas as analyzed in EIR Section 3.1.2, Hydrology and Water Quality.
164	<ul> <li>Modifications to the floodway shall meet all of the following criteria:</li> <li>a. Concrete or rip-rap flood control channels are allowed only where findings are made that completion of the channel is necessary to protect existing buildings from a current flooding problem. Buildings constructed after the enactment of the Resource Protection Ordinance shall not be the basis for permitting such channels.</li> <li>b. Modification will not unduly accelerate the velocity of water so as to create a condition which would increase erosion (and related downstream sedimentation) or would be detrimental to the health and safety of persons or property or adversely affect wetlands or riparian habitat.</li> <li>In high velocity streams where it is necessary to protect existing housing and other structures to minimize stream scour or avoid an increase in the transport of stream sediment to downstream wetlands and other environmentally sensitive habitat areas, grade control structures and other erosion control techniques, including the use of rip-rap, that are designed to be compatible with the environmental setting of the river, may be permitted. The use of rip-rap shall be allowed only when there is no other less environmentally damaging alternative feasible</li> </ul>	Not Applicable		The Project Area is outside of designated 100- and 500-year floodplain areas and other special flood hazard areas as analyzed in EIR Section 3.1.2, Hydrology and Water Quality.
165	All uses permitted by zoning and those that are allowable in the floodway area allowable in the floodplain fringe, when the following criteria are met:  a. Fill shall be limited to that necessary to elevate the structure above the elevation of the floodway and to permit minimal functional use of the structure (e.g., fill for access ramps and drainage). If fill is placed in the floodplain fringe, the new bank of the stream shall be landscaped to blend with the natural vegetation of the stream and enhance the natural edge of the stream.  b. Any development below the elevation of the 100-year flood shall be capable of withstanding periodic flooding.  c. The design of the development shall incorporate the findings and recommendation of a site-specific hydrologic study to assure that the development: (1) will not cause significant adverse water resource impacts related to quality or quantity of flow or increase in peak flow to downstream wetlands, lagoons and other sensitive habitat lands; and (2) neither significantly increases nor contributes to downstream bank erosion and sedimentation of wetlands, lagoons or other sensitive habitat lands.	Not Applicable		The Project Area is outside of designated 100- and 500-year floodplain areas and other special flood hazard areas as analyzed in EIR Section 3.1.2, Hydrology and Water Quality.

			1	Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	d. Lot configuration shall be designed in such a manner as to minimize encroachment into the floodplain. The proposed development shall be set back from the floodway boundary a distance equal to 15 percent of the floodway width (but not to exceed one hundred feet), in order to leave an appropriate buffer area adjacent to the floodway. The setback may be greater if required by paragraph f.  Following review of a site specific flood analysis, the floodplain setback required by this paragraph may be reduced by the Director of Planning of the appropriate jurisdiction or the applicable hearing body, upon making all of the following findings:  1. Practical difficulties, unnecessary hardship, or results inconsistent with the general purposes of this ordinance would result from application of the setback; and 2. The reduction in setback will not increase flood-flows siltation and/or erosion, or reduce long-term protection of the floodway, to a greater extent than if the required setback were maintained; and 3. The reduction in setback will not have the effect of granting a special privilege not shared by other property in the same vicinity; and 4. The reduction in setback will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or injurious to the property or improvement in the vicinity in which the property is located; and 5. The reduction in setback will not be incompatible with the General Plan of the appropriate jurisdiction.  e. Where appropriate, flowage and/or open space easements shall be used to ensure future development will not occur in the floodplain.  f. In areas where the Director of Public Works has determined that the potential for erosion or sedimentation in the floodplain is significant, all proposed development shall be set back from the floodway so that it is outside the Erosion/Sedimentation Hazard Area shown on County/City Floodplain Maps. Development will only be allowed in the Erosion/Sedimentation Hazard Area shown on County/City Floodplain Maps. Development will only be all	Project	Method	Discussion
	be achieved in a manner that is compatible with the natural characteristics of the floodplain.  g. If the subject floodplain fringe land also constitutes wetlands, wetland buffer areas, steep slope lands, sensitive			
	habitat lands or significant prehistoric or historic site lands, the use restrictions herein applicable to such areas shall also apply.			
	Significant Effect: Potential increase in contaminant concentrations in Lower Otay Lake due to conversion of undeveloped land to urban			
166	An Urban Runoff Master Plan shall be prepared for Otay Lakes by a qualified hydrologic engineer for the Project prior to or concurrent with the first SPA Plan in a drainage basin affecting Otay Lake. The Master Plan shall determine that the existing water quality at the outflow of the water filtration plant will, at a minimum, be maintained (details omitted for brevity).	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level technical studies and EIR, Section 3.1.2 Hydrology and Water Quality.	The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1) and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These studies were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. These studies detail water quality thresholds at every developed area outlet to natural water courses at much lower thresholds than envisioned at the time of the 1993 Program EIR. Since water quality is addressed prior to entering the Otay Reservoir System, there is no significant impact to the water filtration plan."
167	Best management practices (BMPs) shall be designated and implemented at the SPA Plan level in order to reduce the quantity and improve the quality of surface water runoff. EIRs at the Specific Plan level shall include analysis of specific BMPs in the categories of reduced pollutant generation, reduced pollutant transport, and treatment of polluted runoff. Specific BMPs that shall be considered at the Specific Plan level include:  O Mitigations to reduce impervious surfaces such as grassed swales, filter strips, constructed wetlands, detention ponds, infiltration trenches/basins, replacement of concrete with permeable surface, and use of natural channels where possible.  O Mitigations to reduce or prevent pesticide contamination impacts such as Integrated Pest Management, non-use of pesticides along roadways, use of only EPA-approved chemicals and plan of pesticide use around upcoming precipitation events.	Applicable	Addressed in the Project-level technical studies and EIR, Section 3.1.2 Hydrology and Water Quality. Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1) and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These studies were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. The Project implements Bio-Filtration Basins throughout the site to mitigate for water quality.

		1	1	Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed		Compilance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
				The Proposed Project will integrate site design BMPs to reduce pollutant transport and treat any polluted runoff.  Where feasible, site design BMPs such as conserving natural areas, maintaining natural drainage features and dispersing roof drains to landscaped areas will be implemented.  Source control BMPs are also proposed for the Proposed Project to avoid and reduce pollutants in storm water runoff. The Proposed Project proposes to utilize integrated pest management techniques such as landscaping with native vegetation along with proper pesticide use when maintaining vegetated area.
168	With the first SPA plan in any given basin, a Watershed Impact and Protection Report shall be developed and implemented for each drainage basin.  The impact of 25 percent of the runoff being diverted from the Otay Lakes will be avoided because increased runoff due to impermeable surfaces will substantially offset the lost surface water.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the EIR, Section 3.1.2 Hydrology and Water Quality.	The Project-Level EIR includes a Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2) and Hydromodification Flow Control Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-4). These studies were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. The Project does not propose any diversion from the Otay Lakes Reservoir. All developed and undeveloped portions of the property tributary to the Otay Reservoir pre-development will continue to be tributary to the Otay Reservoir post development.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Degradation of water quality and a reduction m ground-water basin recharge. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-38]			
169	Additional surface water modeling shall be required upon preparation of a final design plan at the Specific Plan level. The standards identified in Section VII of the FPEIR shall be met. This modeling shall analyze:  Location and number of detention basins necessary to control the peak discharge at an acceptable level;  Peak discharge values at specific locations important to the structural design of bridges, etc.; and  Total volume of surface water discharge during a design storm	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level technical studies and EIR, Section 3.1.2 Hydrology and Water Quality	The EIR includes a Drainage Study (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-1) and Major Storm Water Management Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-2). These plans were prepared in compliance with the County of San Diego Hydrology Manual, County of San Diego BMP Design Manual and San Diego Regional Water Quality Control Board Order R9-2013-0001. The Major Storm Water Management Plan details the design and location of bioretention/hydromodification basins at each outlet of developed areas of the property. The Drainage Study details peak discharges at every outlet, including each culvert within the Project. The hydromodification basins detailed in the Major Storm Water Management Plan are designed to mitigate all post development flow volumes to predevelopment levels.
	TRANSPORTATION, CIRCULATION, AND ACCESS			
	Circuition of Effects, largests to the good naturally in the Courth Day, in the State of the good natural in	and 4.0.44.421		
170	At the Specific Plan level, a traffic analysis shall be conducted within the study area of the proposed SPA to identify additional transportation mitigation measures for the construction of new roads, bridges and roadway improvements, and shall implement transportation demand/system management programs and/or facilities or other measures necessary to mitigate traffic impacts on circulation element roads. The standard to be achieved requires that the Project avoid reduction in the existing level of service below "C" with the exception that LOS "D" may occur on signalized arterial segments for a period not to exceed a total of two hours per day. If the existing level of service is below "C", mitigation measures to achieve level of service "C" (with the exception that level of service "D" will be allowed on signalized arterial segments for a period not to exceed a total of two hours per day) must be imposed as conditions of approval for the SPA. Internal village streets/roads are not expected to meet these standards. (Details omitted for brevity)		Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	The Project-level EIR includes a Transportation Impact Study (EIR Appendix 2.9-1), which was conducted in accordance with County standards, and tiers from, and is prepared in conformance with the requirements identified in the Program EIR. EIR Section 2.9.6 provides the necessary mitigation measures to reduce traffic-related impacts. (M-TR-1 through M-TR-16)

				Compliance		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion		
171	To the extent that Otay Ranch contributes to the need for a facility outside of its boundaries. the Project shall contribute (at the level at which it impacts the facility) to the mitigation of the impact by participating in impact fee programs or other means identified at the SPA or tentative map level	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	The Proposed Project will participate in the County of San Diego's Transportation Impact Fee Program (M-TR-4).		
172	Applicants on the Otay Valley Parcel shall contribute their "fair share" to the capital and operating costs associated with the transit facilities serving the Project. This shall be done through provisions in facility financing plans at the Specific Plan level. Further, benefit assessment districts shall be established to fund new transit routes under MTDB Board Policy No. 40 Non-Transit Funding of Transit Services.	Not Applicable		The Measures applies to development within the Otay Valley Parcel. The Proposed Project is within the Proctor Valley Parcel.		
	Significant Effects: Impacts to road segments and intersections due to increase in traffic associated with Otay Ranch. [FPEIR, Volume 2,	p. 4.9.11-1 through p. 4.9.11	-49.11- 27]			
173	The Applicant shall participate in fair share funding and implementation of the following general mitigation measures:  Prepare Transportation Demand Management (TDM) Mitigation Strategies (See: SANDAG Report "Trip Making in Traditional San Diego Communities", February 1993) Prepare Transportation Phasing Plans Provide Parallel Arterial System Improve Mode Split Increase Local/Regional Trip Capture Update General Plans  Regional Freeway System Mitigation: Increase Freeway Capacities  Arterial Segment Mitigation: Increase Segment Capacities  Arterial Intersection Mitigation: Increase Intersection Capacities  Other Mitigation Strategies:	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed at the Project-level EIR.	The Project-level EIR, Section 2.9, Transportation and Traffic and the Transportation Impact Study (EIR Appendix 2.9-1) addresses all project impacts and fair-share funding (M-TR-4) obligations and applicable funding mechanisms. EIR Section 2.9.6 provides the necessary mitigation measures to reduce traffic-related impacts.		
	<ul> <li>Implement Transportation System Management Strategies</li> <li>Implement Traffic Control Strategies</li> </ul>					
174	For each SPA, the Applicant shall prepare a detailed analysis of peak hour turning movement volumes and intersection capacity for all major affected intersections as determined by the traffic engineer representing the reviewing jurisdiction or agency. (At a minimum, these study area intersections include all intersections with entering volumes in excess of 65,000 vehicles per day under the proposed land use plan.) This analysis will define the mitigation measures necessary to achieve levels of service described above. If the proposed land use plan has not been evaluated by the SANDAG model, or, if the SANDAG model has been substantially modified, (i.e., updated land use and/or network assumptions), then updated modeling of the SPA project shall be required to allow the completion of detailed peak hour analyses.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	The Project-level EIR, Section 2.9, Transportation and Traffic and the Transportation Impact Study (EIR Appendix 2.9-1) addresses all Project impacts, fair-share funding obligations and applicable funding mechanisms.		
175	The Applicant shall construct as a condition of approval to the SPA, new roads, bridges and roadway improvements, and shall implement transportation demand/system management programs and/or facilities, or other measures necessary to fully mitigate traffic impacts (related to traffic impacts of the Project) on circulation element roads, to avoid reduction in the existing Level of Service below "C", with the exception that LOS "D" may occur on signalized arterials for a period not to exceed a total of two hours per day	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	The Project-level EIR, Section 2.9, Transportation and Traffic and the Transportation Impact Study (EIR Appendix 2.9-1) addresses all project impacts and fair-share funding obligations and applicable funding mechanisms.		
176	No more than 15,000 dwelling units or 4,000,000 million square feet of commercial may be constructed within the Project until funding and construction for LRT (Light Rail Transit) is assured. As described earlier, Applicants in the Otay River parcel shall contribute their "fair share" to the funding of these facilities and operating costs.	Ranch-wide	Satisfied: Ranch-wide threshold has been met as LRT funding and construction is assured. See discussion.	SANDAG/MTS secured funding and are constructing South Bay Rapid transit improvements through Otay Ranch on the Otay River parcel. Funding is not applicable to the Proctor Valley Parcel and the Proposed Project.		

			Compliance
		Applicable to Proposed	·
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method Discussion
	Project-specific Mitigation Measures: Onsite Network		
177	Upgrade Eastlake Parkway between Orange Avenue and EUC North from 4-lane major to 6-lane major and provide special at-grade intersection	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
	design 3 or grade separated intersection design		incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
178	Upgrade Village 2 Local between EUC North (La Media Road) and EUC North (Village 2 Loop Road) from 2-lane local collector to 4-lane	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
	collector		incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
179	Upgrade Village 3 Local between Village 3 Local (Village 3 Loop Road) and Paseo Ranchero from 2-lane local collector to 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
180	Upgrade Village 3 Local (Village 3 Loop Road) from 2-lane local collector to 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
181	Upgrade Village 6 Local between EUC Major and Village 6 Collector from 2-lane local collector to 4-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
182	Upgrade Village 7 Local between Village 7 Collector and Village 7 Major from 2-lane local collector to 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
183	Upgrade Village 7 Local between Village 7 Major and Village 7 Collector from 2-lane local collector to 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting
10.1	Project-specific Mitigation Measures: Offsite Network - Fair Share Funding for the Following:		
184	Upgrade Bonita Road between 1-805 and Plaza Bonita Road by providing at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable	Outside project area – Project-level traffic studies
405		N. C. P. III	incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
185	Upgrade Bonita Road between Plaza Bonita Road and Willow Street by providing special at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
400		N. C. P. III	forecasting.
186	Upgrade Bonita Road between Willow Street and Otay Lakes Road by providing special at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
407	Heart De No De Heiler Official de Destado de La Contrada de La Con	Not A self-self-	forecasting.
187	Upgrade Bonita Road between Otay Lakes Road and Central Avenue by providing special at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
100	Harvada Carrina Maswiladara hatwaa Otsu Masa Daad and Haritara Daad from a Olana callastan ta a Alana callastan	Net Applicable	forecasting.
188	Upgrade Camino Maquiladora between Otay Mesa Road and Heritage Road from a 2-lane collector to a 4-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
			incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
189	Upgrade Camoustie Road between Harvest Road and Domoch Court from a 2- lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
109	Opgrade Camoustie Road between Harvest Road and Domoch Court from a 2- lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
			forecasting.
190	Upgrade Del Sol Road west of Paseo Ranchero from a 2-lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
130	opgrade Del 301 Noad West of Paseo Nationero from a 2-lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
			forecasting.
191	Upgrade East H Street between 1-805 and Terra Nova Road from a 6-lane prime to an 8-lane prime	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
131	opgrade Last it Street between 1-005 and Tena Nova Road Ironi a 0-lane prime to all 0-lane prime	Not Applicable	incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
			forecasting.
192	Upgrade EastLake Parkway between Palomar Street and Orange Avenue from 4- lane major to 6-lane prime and provide special at-grade	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
.02	intersection design		incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
			forecasting.
193	Upgrade EastLake Greens between Hunte Parkway and Hunte Parkway from a 2-lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
.00	opgrade EdelEdite Stooms Settroom Hante Fairmay and Hante Fairmay from a 2 faire collector to a charte collector		incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and
			forecasting.
194	Upgrade EastLake Local between EastLake Parkway and EastLake Greens from 2-lane collector to a 4-lane collector	Not Applicable	Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies
	THE THE PARTY OF T	The state of the s	incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
195	Upgrade EastLake Trails between Hunte Parkway and Hunte Parkway from a 2- lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
196	Upgrade Hunte Parkway between EastLake Trails and Orange Avenue from a 4- lane major to a 6-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
197	Upgrade La Media Road between SR-905 and Airway Road from a 4-lane major to a 6-lane prime	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
198	Upgrade Oleander Avenue between Telegraph Canyon Road and Naples Avenue from a 2-lane collector to a 4-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
199	Upgrade Otay Lakes Road between East H Street and Telegraph Canyon Road by providing special at grade design (see footnote 2 above) or grade separated intersection design	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
200	Upgrade Otay Lakes Road between SR-125 and EastLake Parkway from a 6-lane prime to an 8-lane prime and by providing special atgrade intersection design (see footnote 2 above) or grade separated intersections	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
201	Upgrade Paseo Del Rey between East H Street and Telegraph Canyon Road from a 2-lane collector to a 4-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
202	Upgrade Paseo Ranchero between East J Street and Telegraph Canyon Road from a 4-lane collector to a 4-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
203	Upgrade Sweetwater Road between Bonita Mesa Road and Willow Street from 4-lane collector to 6-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
204	Upgrade Sweetwater Road between Bonita Road and SR-54 from 4-lane collector to 4-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
205	Upgrade Willow Street between Sweetwater Road and Bonita Road from 4-lane collector to 4-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
	If forecasted reductions in traffic activity resulting from village design and TDM analysis do not occur, additional mitigation, as identified	in the FPEIR, would be required on	the following segments:	· · ·
206	Upgrade EUC North between Village 2 Local and La Media Road from a 4-lane collector to a 4-lane major, and by providing special at-grade intersection design (see footnote 1 above) or grade separated intersection design	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
207	Upgrade Village 5 Local between Village 5 Collector and Palomar Street from 2-lane local collector to 3-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
208	Upgrade Village 6 Local between Village 6 Collector and EUC Major from 2- lane local collector to 3-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
209	Upgrade Central Avenue between Bonita Road and Carrol Canyon Road from a 2-lane collector to a 4-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
210	Hunte Parkway between Otay Lakes Road and Eastlake Greens from a 4-lane major to a 6-lane major and by providing special at-grade intersection design	Applicable	Complete: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and Transportation Impact Study (EIR Appendix 2.9-1).	The Transportation Impact Study (EIR Appendix 2.9-1) prepared for the Proposed Project evaluated this segment of Hunte Parkway and found that the Proposed Project would not significantly impact this segment of Hunte Parkway. Based on the City of Chula Vista adopted Circulation Element, this section of Hunte Parkway is already constructed to its ultimate classification as a fourlane major arterial. Finally, based on the analysis conducted within the Transportation Impact Study, this segment of Hunte Parkway is anticipated to operate at LOS A under Cumulative Year 2030 conditions; therefore, there would be no nexus to improve the segment to a six-lane major arterial.
211	Upgrade La Media Road between Otay Mesa Road and SR-905 from a 4-lane major to a 6-lane major by providing special at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
212	Upgrade Brittania Boulevard between SR-905 and Airway Road from a 4-lane major to a 6-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
213	Upgrade Millar Ranch Road between SR-94 and Proctor Valley Road from a 4- lane collector to a 4-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
214	Upgrade Orange Avenue between Hunte Parkway and EastLake Vista from a 4- lane major to a 6-lane major by providing special at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
215	Otay Lakes Road between Bonita Road and East H Street by providing special at- grade intersection design	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
216	Upgrade Paseo Ranchero between Otay Valley Road and Del Sol Road by providing special at-grade intersection design	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
217	Upgrade Wueste Road between Otay Lakes Road and Orange Avenue from a 2- lane collector to a 3-lane collector	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
	If forecasted reductions in traffic activity resulting from village design and TDM analysis do not occur, additional segment mitigation, bey	ond special at-grade intersec	ction upgrades, as identified previously	, would be required:
218	Bonita Road between 1-805 and Plaza Bonita Road from 4-lane major to 6-lane prime	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
219	Bonita Road between Plaza Bonita Road and Willow Street from 4-lane major to 6-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
220	Bonita Road between Willow Street and Otay Lakes Road from 4-lane major to 6-lane prime	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
221	Bonita Road between Otay Lakes Road and Central Avenue from 4-lane major to 6-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
222	Bonita Road between Central Avenue and San Miguel Road from a 4-lane collector to a 4-lane major	Not Applicable		Outside of project impact area – Project-level traffic studies incorporate more up-to-date trip generation and forecasting.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Impacts on short-term and long-term traffic operations. [FPEIR, p. 6-40]		·	·
223	Projects in the region will be required to construct appropriate improvements and contribute their proportionate share towards construction of regional facilities.	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	The Proposed Project will participate in the County of San Diego's Transportation Impact Fee Program (M-TR-4) and construct Proctor Valley Road, a County General Plan Mobility Element facility. (M-TR-1 through M-TR-16)
	AIR QUALITY		,	
	Significant Effect: Air quality impacts would exceed the current State Implementation Plan (SIP) air quality attainment regulations which PM-10 from vehicular and stationary sources would add to existing violations of federal and state ozone standards. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p		es 7 growth projections. Also, Project e	missions of NOx, reactive organic gases (ROG), CO, and
224	The Applicant shall incorporate into the SPA plans all feasible measures developed by the County of San Diego in the Regional Air Quality Strategy (RAQS) in response to the California Clean Air Act (CCAA).		Satisfied: Addressed in Project-level EIR.	The Proposed Project is consistent with the RAQS as determined in EIR Section 2.3, Air Quality.
225	<ul> <li>The Applicant shall incorporate into the SPA plans the following measures:         <ul> <li>Land Use</li> </ul> </li> <li>Neighborhood shopping and personal services adjacent to residential areas to minimize auto trips and reduce mileage traveled to service areas.</li> <li>Open space and recreational facilities within or adjacent to the residential areas.</li> <li>Employee services within walking distance (i.e., banking, child care, restaurants, etc).</li> <li>A balanced mix of housing and employment possibilities to reduce trips and vehicle miles traveled</li> </ul>	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	<ul> <li>The Proposed Project includes a Village Core with 10,000 SF retail/commercial.</li> <li>The Proposed Project includes 24.7-acres of parks</li> <li>The Village Core provides for these uses.</li> <li>The Proposed Project includes a Transportation Demand Management Program.</li> </ul>
	Siting/Design  The avoidance of potentially incompatible projects (for example, a residential development near one of the quarries or the landfill).  Dedicated bike lanes to encourage use of bicycles.			<ul> <li>The Proposed Project is consistent with the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP and County General Plan.</li> <li>The Proposed Project includes bike lanes on Proctor Valley Road.</li> </ul>
				Bicycles racks will be provided.
	<ul> <li>Bicycle storage facilities at employment and retail centers. Shower and locker facilities at offices to encourage bicycle use.</li> <li>Sidewalks and curbs to ensure safe pedestrian travel within residential areas and to commercial centers.</li> </ul>			<ul> <li>All streets have sidewalks/pathways and curbs (See Tentative Map 5616, Sheet 3)</li> <li>Street sections have been reviewed and accepted by</li> </ul>
	Street designs that promote pedestrian safety (i.e., safe islands in center of major arterials, "Walk" signals, night lighting, etc.).			<ul><li>County.</li><li>N/A – no shopping center proposed</li></ul>
	Shopping centers oriented to promote use by mass transit (i.e., provide bus turnouts, pedestrians, and bicyclists).			The Proposed Project will comply with
	Parking lots designed to promote use of mass transit and car pools.			State/CalGreen code re: preferred parking for transit and carpools.
	The installation of heat transfer modules on gas-fired furnaces to control emissions of NOx.			ZNE required for all residential buildings.
	<ul> <li>Solar heating to heat water for domestic use and for swimming pools. Advances in solar technology in the future may make other applications appropriate.</li> </ul>			Compliance with CA state law (Title 24), additional energy efficient PDFs.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	<ul> <li>Low-NOx residential and commercial water heaters.</li> <li>Enhanced energy efficiency in building designs and landscaping plans.</li> <li>Identify an environmental coordinator to be responsible for education and disseminating information on ridesharing and/or mass transit opportunities, recycling, energy conservation programs, etc.</li> </ul>			TDM program coordinator. (PDF-TR-1)
	Transportation-related Management Actions			
	<ul> <li>Land for transit support facilities such as bus stops, park- and-ride lots, etc. shall be provided. A determination to dedicate land shall be made in consultation with the Metropolitan Transportation Development Board (MTDB).</li> </ul>			Potential transit stop identified in Village Core.
	<ul> <li>Amenities to increase convenience and attractiveness of transit stops (i.e., passenger staging areas, waiting shelters, etc.) shall be provided.</li> </ul>			Potential transit stop identified in Village Core.
	Demand-responsive traffic signals shall be negotiated.			Roundabouts proposed along Proctor Valley Road in place of traffic signals to ensure flow of traffic.
	An agreement with the transit agency to institute new routes or express bus service, or to expand existing service, related to the demand caused by the Project shall be negotiated.			<ul> <li>Potential transit stop identified in Village Core at discretion of transit-provider.</li> </ul>
	Fair share participation for transit facilities and operation shall be required.			Potential transit stop identified in Village Core and payment of TIF.
	Compliance with APCD Indirect Source Control Program, if adopted. Major employers shall provide ridesharing or mass transit incentives.			<ul> <li>Consistent with SANDAG The Regional Plan. No major employers are anticipated within the Proposed Project</li> </ul>
226	No more than 15,000 dwelling units or 4,000,000 million square feet of commercial may be constructed until funding and construction for LRT is assured.	Applicable	Satisfied: Ranch-wide threshold. See #176 above.	SANDAG/MTS secured funding and are constructing South Bay Rapid transit improvements through Otay Ranch. See #176 above.
	Significant Effect: Short-term emissions would occur during Project construction. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.12-1]			
227	<ul> <li>The following conditions shall be included in each SPA Plan:</li> <li>Minimize simultaneous operation of multiple construction equipment units</li> <li>Low pollutant-emitting construction equipment shall be used.</li> <li>Electrical construction equipment shall be used, as practical.</li> <li>Catalytic reduction for gasoline-powered equipment shall be used.</li> <li>Injection timing retard for diesel-powered equipment shall be used.</li> <li>The construction area shall be watered at least twice daily to minimize fugitive dust.</li> <li>Graded areas shall be stabilized (for example, hydroseeded) upon completion of grading to minimize fugitive dust.</li> <li>Permanent roads shall be paved immediately after grading to minimize dust.</li> </ul>	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures addressed in Project-level EIR and technical studies	An Air Quality Analysis (EIR Appendix 2.3-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project and recommends measures includes Measures M-AQ-1 through M-AQ-8, as well as PDF-AQ-1, which implement these measures.

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Stationary and vehicular emissions would aggravate the San Diego Air Basin's current inability to attain sta	ate and federal air quality sta		
228	The cumulatively significant degradation of regional air quality can be mitigated but not below a level of significance by implementing public transit and trip reduction programs onsite and by requiring housing and building designs that minimize air pollutant emissions. It is a policy of the County to require applicants to participate in the strategies listed above. The Lead Agency has required Applicants within the Otay parcel to contribute their fair share to LRT.	Applicable	Achieved through implementation of Project design Features.	<b>M-GHG-4</b> requires implementation of all Project Design Features, including PDF-TR-1 – Transportation Demand Management Plan, and PDF-AQ/GHG-2, Zero Net Energy Development. These PDFs reduce trips on-site and require housing and building designs that minimize air quality pollutant emissions.
			LRT is a ranch-wide threshold.	SANDAG/MTS secured funding and are constructing South Bay Rapid transit improvements through Otay Ranch.
	NOISE			
	Significant Effect: Noise levels in many areas of the Project would exceed the 60dBA CNEL standard for residential uses. Also, indirect rough constraints. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.13-1 through p. 4.9.13-3]	padway and construction nois	se would exceed the 60 dBA Leq standa	ard for Least Bell's vireo habitat and California
229	<ul> <li>The GDP text identifies areas where a site-specific study is required. The identified areas shall include the following:         <ul> <li>Areas within 9300 feet of the Nelson and Sloan Mining Operation and the Daley Quarry, and other operating quarries;</li> <li>All areas within the 60 CNEL noise contour of onsite and offsite roadways, which shall include all roadways on the Otay River parcel and all roadways assigned a future ADT of 3000 trips or greater on the Proctor Valley and San Ysidro parcels;</li> <li>All areas within 1250 feet of the Otay Landfill;</li> <li>All areas within one mile of the San Diego Air Sports Center; and</li> <li>All areas adjacent to Least Bell's Vireo habitat and California Gnatcatcher habitat.</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Not Applicable		The Project Area is not within any of the identified areas requiring a site-specific study. However, the Project-level EIR includes a Noise Report (EIR Appendix 2.8-1) performed according to County standards.
230	Site-specific acoustical analyses shall be required during SPA Plan review and approval prior to adoption of any Circulation Element General Plan Amendments. The study shall provide a description of the Project, the existing noise environment, the methods of evaluation, the future acoustical environment, noise impacts, and the required mitigation measures. The study shall be prepared by a qualified acoustician in accordance with local standards for preparation of such studies. The following standards shall be achieved:  Residential development within the impact area shall not be allowed unless the site-specific noise study shows that the exterior noise level can be mitigated to 45 CNEL or below.  Impacts to Least Bell's Vireo and California Gnatcatcher habitat shall be mitigated to achieve a level of 60 OBA Leq or below.  Proper site planning to reduce noise impacts shall be utilized for all noise sensitive land uses. Site planning techniques shall include the following:  Place commercial uses adjacent to the high noise roadways such as Heritage Road, Orange Avenue, Otay Valley Road, Paseo Ranchero, and State Route 125.  Place less noise-sensitive land uses on parcels closest to significant noise generators such as the Nelson and Sloan Mining Operation, the Daley Quarry, the Otay Landfill, and adjacent to the various industrial activities and other quarry operations.  Increase the distance from the noise source to sensitive receptors by creation of setbacks.  Place noise-sensitive land uses ostide of the 60 CNEL noise contour of roadways.  Place non-noise sensitive uses such as parking lots and utility areas between the noise source and receiver.  Orient usable outdoor living space such as balconies, patios, and children play areas away from roadways  Noise barriers such as walls and earthen berms shall be used to mitigate noise from ground transportation sources when setbacks are not feasible. To be effective, a barrier(s) shall block the line-of-sight from the source to the receiver. A barrier shall also be o	Applicable	Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR, Section 2.8, Noise.	While the Proposed Project includes an amendment to the County General Plan Mobility Element, the amendment is to reduce the classification of the Proctor Valley Road. Since adoption of the Otay Ranch GDP/SRP, cumulative traffic on Proctor Valley Road has been reduced due to the acquisition of portions of Otay Ranch for conservation purposes. The Project-level EIR includes a Noise Study (EIR Appendix 2.8-1) prepared in accordance with County standards. In addition, M-BI-18 addresses noise impacts to biological resources, including California Gnatcatcher.  All impacts related to traffic-related noise are mitigated to less than significant through implementation of mitigation measures with the exception of one off-site impact area where noise levels would remain below the applicable County standard for residential land uses but would represent a substantial increase above existing conditions (see M-N-1 through M-N-10, EIR Section 2.8.6).

**DUDEK** 

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Exposure or residential and other noise sensitive land uses to vehicular noise levels exceeding local noise			
231	Future acoustical studies shall be required for residences and other noise sensitive land uses exposed to exterior noise levels of 60 CNEL or greater for all projects within the jurisdiction of the agency.	Applicable	Addressed in the Project-level EIR. Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures.	The Project-level EIR includes a Noise Study (EIR Appendix 2.8-1) prepared in accordance with County standards. (M-N-2)
232	Future acoustical studies shall be required for Least Bell's Vireo habitat and California Gnatcatcher habitat exposed to noise levels of 60 DBA leq or greater for all projects within the jurisdiction of the agency.	Applicable	Achieved through Regulatory Compliance with the MSCP.	The Proposed Project complies with the MSCP Adjacency Guidelines (See Draft EIR, Section 2.4), and provides a preserve buffer as required by the Preserve Edge Plan. (M-BI-18)
233	Noise attenuation techniques, such as construction of walls and/or earthen berms between sensitive uses and significant noise sources shall be required to achieve standards as discussed in Section VIII of the FPEIR.	Applicable	Satisfied: Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	The Project-level EIR includes a noise study prepared in accordance with County standards. EIR, Section 2.8, Noise, includes mitigation measures required to reduce all impacts to less than significant (M-N-1 through M-N-10) with the exception of Impact N-3, which is an increase in off-site traffic noise of greater than 10 dBA. However, the noise level at this location is below the County's threshold for residential uses (60 dBA).
	PUBLIC SERVICES AND FACILITIES			
	Water Availability and Supply			
	Significant Effect: Project-generated water requirements would result in significant impacts related to the capability of local jurisdictions	to provide adequate water [E	DEID Volumo 2 n 4 0 14 11	
234	Upon completion of the comprehensive master plan currently under preparation by the Otay Water District (OWD), the facilities proposed for the	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-	The Project-level EIR includes an Overview of Water
204	Otay Ranch Project shall be reviewed for conformance to this plan and current OWD standards, if the Project is ultimately annexed to OWD	Аррисаые	level EIR and WSA provided by Otay Water District.	Service study (EIR Appendix 3.1.8-2) prepared in accordance with County standards. The Proposed Project is within the Otay Water District boundaries.
235	Annexation of land to the appropriate water jurisdiction as necessary.	Not Applicable		Annexation into a water jurisdiction is not required, as the Project Area is within the Otay Water District boundary.
236	<ul> <li>Applicant shall prepare and submit for the appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to the first SPA Plan, a Water Master Plan. The Water Master Plan shall include:         <ul> <li>A Public Facilities Financing and Phasing Plan.</li> <li>A Water Conservation Plan which shall include an analysis of water usage requirements as well as a detailed plan of proposed measures for water conservation.</li> <li>A Water Reclamation Plan which shall include a reclaimed water distribution system</li> <li>A Reclaimed Water Uses and Restrictions Plan</li> </ul> </li> <li>The Master Plan shall be consistent with the GDP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall not be approved unless the Water Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).</li> </ul>	Applicable	Satisfied: Satisfied at the Project-level through SPA-specific studies.	The Overview of Water Service (EIR Appendix 3.1.8-1) and Water Conservation Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-3) was prepared for the Proposed Project. In addition, the Public Facilities Financing Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project which addresses demand, funding and phasing of water facilities necessary to serve the Proposed Project. The Otay Water District (OWD) issued a SB 610/221 Water Supply Assessment and Verification Report (Appendix 3.1.8-4) for the Proposed Project.
237	The Water Master Plan will provide:  Design criteria and assumptions, in accordance with the appropriate agency and regulatory authorities.  Information on how the Project will satisfy MWD's Water Use Efficiency Guidelines.  Location and size of facilities for onsite and offsite improvements. Operations and terminal storage.	Applicable	Satisfied: Satisfied at the Project-level through SPA-specific studies.	The Overview of Water Service (EIR Appendix 3.1.8-1) and Water Conservation Plan (EIR Appendix 3.1.2-3) were prepared for the Proposed Project. In addition to the water facilities plans listed above, the Proposed Project will be required to prepare a Subarea Master Plan, pursuant to Otay Water District Requirements, prior to OWD approval of improvement plans within the Proposed Project. The Otay Water District (OWD) issued a SB 610/221 Water Supply Assessment and Verification Report (Appendix 3.1.8-4) for the Proposed Project.

			Compliance		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion	
238	Written verification from the water district that water will be provided concurrent with need shall be required prior to tentative map approval	Applicable	Satisfied: Satisfied at the Specific Plan level.	A Water Supply Assessment and Verification Report (EIR Appendix 3.1.8-4) was prepared for the Proposed Project and was approved by the Otay Water District Board of Directors on January 3, 2018.	
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Availability of water to serve region. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-45]				
239	Mitigation measures shall include the preparation of water facilities studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts on the water supply system to determine the significance of those impacts on water facilities, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effects. These studies and plans shall include an analysis of the cumulative water demand and survey of the water necessary to serve existing, proposed, and approved projects within each service zone.	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Satisfied at the Project-level through SPA-specific studies.	See Comment #237 above.	
240	Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and to construct, or contribute toward the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study with respect to the cumulative water demand as a result of new development.	Applicable	Satisfied: Achieved through updated or replacement Project-Level Mitigation Measures. Measures incorporated into Project-level EIR.	See Comment #237 above.	
	Wastewater and Sewer Service		•		
	Significant Effect: Facilities to accommodate additional sewage flow and wastewater treatment would be required. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p.				
241	Prior to approval of any SPA Plan within Otay Ranch, it shall be determined which sewer district will serve the proposed SPA. The Project shall obtain written verification from the applicable sewer district that the tract or parcel will be provided adequate sewer service concurrent with need (a "will serve" letter). When applicable, the Project shall obtain written approval from the County Department of Health Services for private subsurface sewage disposal systems.	''	Satisfied: Satisfied at the Project-level through SPA-specific studies.	An Overview of Sewer Service (EIR Appendix 3.8.1-1) was prepared for the project. The Proposed Project will be conditioned to annex into the County Sanitation District. The County and City of Chula Vista have entered into a Sewer Transportation Agreement that includes capacity to serve the Proposed Project. A service letter from the County Sanitation District has been provided.	
242	A Sewer Master Plan shall be prepared in conformance with the sewer engineering and facility siting standards of the appropriate jurisdictions for each SPA. The Master Plan shall address location and size of facilities for onsite and offsite improvements in accordance with the appropriate agency and regulatory requirements, and a Public Facilities Financing and Phasing Plan.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	An Overview of Sewer Service (EIR Appendix 3.8.1-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project in conformance with County requirements.  Public Facility Finance Plan (PFFP) (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project. The PFFP analyzed the demand for sewer facilities and phasing, funding and financing of sewer facilities and infrastructure necessary to serve the Proposed Project.	
243	The Sewer Master Plan shall achieve Design Criteria and Assumptions in accordance with the appropriate agency and regulating authorities.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	An Overview of Sewer Service (EIR Appendix 3.8.1-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project in conformance with County requirements.	
244	The Sewer Master Plan shall be approved prior to the approval of each SPA plan within Otay Ranch.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR.	The County has reviewed and approved the Overview of Sewer Service report.	
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Increased flow generation. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-46]				
245	Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of sewer basin studies and financing plans in order to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect upon the sewerage system. These studies and plans shall include an analysis of the cumulative sewage flow to be generated by existing, proposed, and approved projects within each basin.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	See Comment #242 above.	
246	Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and to construct, or contribute toward the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study for wastewater conveyance, treatment, and disposal in proportion to the flows contributed by each development with respect to the cumulative flows from the new developments.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies.	The Public Facility Finance Plan (PFFP) (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project. The PFFP analyzed the demand for sewer facilities and phasing, funding and financing of sewer facilities and infrastructure necessary to serve the Proposed Project.	

Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed		
willigation measure (note – the project as defined in this column is the entire olay Nanch)	Project	Method	Discussion
Integrated Waste Management			
Significant Effect: Project-generated solid waste would impact the landfill capacity in the region. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-3]			
An Integrated Waste Management Master Plan (IWMMP) shall be prepared in coordination with the City of Chula Vista and the County of San Diego. The IWMMP will provide for participation in an integrated waste management program to include:  Curbside recycling  Neighborhood recycling/buyback centers.  A material recovery facility.  A composting facility.	Applicable	Satisfied: Satisfied through County-wide Integrated Waste Management Plan – addressed in Project-level EIR.	See Specific Plan, Regional Facilities Report.
•	Not Applicable		The County developed and adopted a County-wide plan
	Νοι Αρριισαρίο		that satisfies this requirement.
Each SPA Plan shall include a condition requiring the Applicant to comply with City of Chula of Vista and County of San Diego programs and regulations concerning long-term solid waste capacity.	Applicable	Satisfied: Satisfied through County- wide Integrated Waste Management Plan – addressed in Project-level EIR.	See Specific Plan, Regional Facilities Report.
Significant Cumulative Effect: Declining landfill capacity in the region. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-47]		•	
Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of solid waste facilities studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on the integrated waste management system, such as recycling facilities and landfill capacity. These studies shall include an analysis of the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of existing, proposed and approved projects.	Applicable	Satisfied: Satisfied through County-wide Integrated Waste Management Plan – addressed in Project-level EIR.	See Specific Plan Regional Facilities Report.
Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study with respect to the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of new development.	Applicable	Satisfied: The County developed and adopted a County-wide plan that satisfies this requirement.	See Specific Plan Regional Facilities Report.
Police and Fire Protection, Emergency Medical Services			
A Law Enforcement Services Master Plan shall be developed in coordination with the service provider and based on jurisdictional arrangements.	Applicable	Satisfied: Law enforcement services analysis provided in PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.6.1-1).	The San Diego County Sheriff's Department reviewed the Proposed Project and determined that the Proposed Project will be served by a 500 square foot Sheriff's storefront facility located within the Village 14 core area.
The Law Enforcement Services Master Plan shall address city/county law enforcement standards the staff needs of the California Highway Patrol (CHP), and include:  The types of facilities and equipment to be provided. Site and location criteria. Design techniques and guidelines to minimize crime. Funding mechanisms identified by the appropriate law enforcement agency and implementation method assured.	Not Applicable		The Proposed Project will be served by the County Sheriff's Department. The California Highway Patrol will not serve the Project.
The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The Law Enforcement Services Master Plan shall assure the Project meets the following standards:  • Provide properly equipped and staffed law enforcement units to respond to 84 percent of "Priority One" emergency calls within 7 minutes and maintain an average response time of all "Priority One" emergency calls of 4.5 minutes or less. (Urban service)  • Provide properly equipped and staffed law enforcement units to respond to 62 percent of "Priority Two Urgent" calls within 7 minutes and maintain an average response time to all "Priority Two" calls of 7 minutes or less. (Urban service)  • Provide facilities for properly equipped and staffed law enforcement units to maintain an average response time for "Priority One" calls of 12 minutes, and 24 minutes for low priority calls. (Rural service)	Applicable	Satisfied: Law enforcement services analysis provided in PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.6.1-1).	The PFFP has been reviewed and accepted by the County of San Diego  The PFFP includes a response time analysis which demonstrates that, with the provision of a Sheriff's storefront facility within the Village 14 core area, applicable rural response time standards will be met.
	Diego. The IWMMP will provide for participation in an integrated waste management program to include:  Curbside recycling Neighborhood recycling/buyback centers.  A material recovery facility.  A composting facility.  Base Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall include a condition requiring the Applicant to comply with City of Chula of Vista and County of San Diego programs and regulations concerning long-term solid waste capacity.  Significant Cumulative Effect: Declining landfill capacity in the region. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-47]  Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of solid waste facilities studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on the integrated waste management system, such as recycling facilities and landfill capacity. These studies shall include an analysis of the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of existing, proposed and approved projects.  Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study with respect to the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of new development.  Police and Fire Protection, Emergency Medical Services Significant Effect: The Clay Ranch population would result in the need for additional staff and facilities to provide these services. [FPEIR]  A Law Enforcement Services Master Plan shall address city/county law enforcement standards the staff nee	Diego. The IMMMP will provide for participation in an integrated waste management program to include:  Curbside responding Neighborhood recycling/buyback centers.  A material recovery facility.  A composting facility.  A composting facility.  A bousehold hazardous waste collection facility.  The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall not be approved unless the Integrated Waste Management Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).  Each SPA Plan shall incide a condition requiring the Applicant to comply with City of Chula of Vista and County of San Diego programs and regulations concerning long-term solid waste capacity.  Significant Cumulative Effect: Declining landfill capacity in the region. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-47]  Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of solid waste facilities studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on the integrated waste management system, such as recycling facilities and landfill capacity. These studies shall include an analysis of the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of existing, proposed and approved projects.  Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the suby with respect to the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of existing, proposed and approved projects.  Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the suby with respect to the cumulative solid waste generation as a result of existing properties and properties properties and contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required to the subject of the	Diagn. The WMMP will provide for participation in an integrated weste management program to include:  Custate recycling Nalgiborhood recycling/buyback centers.  A natival recovery facility.  A composting facility.  The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approvals). The SRA Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approvals). The SRA Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approvals). The SRA Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approvals). The SRA Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approvals). The SRA Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or condition appropriate jurisdiction approval of Sald waste facilities shall recomply makes the desired by the specific improvement applicable shall be required to construct Project-level EIR.  Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approved of sald waste shall be required to construct Project-level EIR.  Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and contribute owards the cost of constructing any regional facilities required by the specific project-level EIR.  Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project-specific improvements and contribute owards the cost of constructing any regional facilities of constructing approval of constructing any regio

				Compliance
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
255	Applicant shall prepare and submit for appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to the first SPA Plan in close coordination with the appropriate service provider, a Fire Master Plan. The Fire Master Plan shall address:  Facilities requirements of the city and county including equipment needs. Site selection criteria.  Specific site locations.  Funding mechanisms	Applicable	Satisfied: The PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.6-2) and Fire Protection Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-2).	The PFFP and Fire Protection Plan have been reviewed and accepted by the County of San Diego and San Diego County Fire Authority.  In addition, prior to the Proposed Project's approval, the Applicant will enter into a Fire Service Agreement with
				SDCFA that determines facility and equipment needs, funding, siting and phasing necessary to serve the Proposed Project.
256	The Master Plan shall demonstrate that the proposed facilities shall enable the fire protection servers to achieve the urban and rural emergency response times established by the City of Chula Vista threshold and County of San Diego Public Facilities Element and include a Sprinkler Plan, an Emergency Disaster Plan, and a Brush Maintenance Plan. The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The Fire Master Plan shall assure the Project meets the following standards:  • Provide sufficient fire and emergency services facilities to respond to calls within the Otay Ranch urban communities: within a 7-minute response time in 85% of the cases; a 10-minute travel time in the Otay Ranch estate communities with lots averaging more than 2 acres (and attendant neighborhood serving commercial) and; a 20-minute travel time in the Otay Ranch rural communities with 4 acre lots or	Applicable	Satisfied: The Fire Protection Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-2).	The Fire Protection Plan includes a response time analysis which demonstrates that, with the provision of a SDCFA fire station within the Village 14 core area, applicable rural response time standards will be met.  The PFFP and Fire Protection Plan have been reviewed and accepted by the County of San Diego and San Diego
	<ul> <li>Provide sufficient fire and emergency services facilities to respond to calls within: Otay Ranch single family communities with residential lots of less than two acres, or more intensive uses as multi-family residential, including industrial development and all commercial development except neighborhood commercial, in a 5 minute travel time; Otay Ranch single- family residential lots from two acres to four acres, including neighborhood commercial development, in a 10 minute travel time; and Otay Ranch large lot single-family residential and agricultural areas with lot sizes greater than four acres in a 20 minute travel time.</li> <li>The SPA Plan shall not be approved unless the Fire Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).</li> </ul>			County Fire Authority.
257	Applicant shall prepare and submit for appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to the first SPA Plan in close coordination with the appropriate service provider, an Emergency Service Master Plan. The Emergency Service Master Plan shall address facilities requirements including facilities for hazardous materials incidents, service locations and funding mechanisms, and shall be approved by the appropriate fire protection district. The master plan shall demonstrate that a 10-minute emergency response time will be achieved by all new or upgraded facilities. The Emergency Service Master Plan shall provide fire protection service facilities concurrent with need, and emergency service facilities concurrent with need.	Applicable	Satisfied: The PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.6-2) and Fire Protection Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-2).	The PFFP and FPP prepared for the Proposed Project analyzed demand for fire protection services generated by the Proposed Project. A SDCFA fire station is planned within the Village 14 core area. Details regarding phasing, funding and fire station equipment, staffing and facility needs are including in the Fire Services Agreement for the Proposed Project.  The County of San Diego and SDCFA have reviewed and accepted the FPP and PFFP.
258	SPA Plans shall include a Public Facilities Financing and Phasing Plan	Applicable	Satisfied: The PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.6-2) and Fire Protection Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-2).	The PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project
259	Each SPA shall be required to meet the criteria of the approved master plan.	Applicable	Satisfied: The PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.6-2) and Fire Protection Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-2).	Achieved as the Specific Plan includes preparation of PFFP, compliance with Implementation Plan and Otay Ranch GDP/SRP standards.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Need for additional facilities to provide services. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-48]			
260	Each Applicant for a discretionary project shall prepare and obtain the appropriate jurisdiction's approval of police protection, fire protection, and emergency service facilities. Studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on police protection, fire protection, and emergency services shall be prepared if appropriate. These studies shall include an analysis of the cumulative demand for these services as a result of existing, proposed and	Applicable	Satisfied: The PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.6-2) and Fire Protection Plan (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-2).	See above #252-259.

			Compliance		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion	
261	Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project specific improvements and to construct, or contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study with respect to the cumulative demand for police protection, fire protection, and emergency service as a result of new development.	Applicable	Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies and achieved through compliance with Conditions of Approval.	A Public Safety Fire Service Agreement is required to be executed prior to Final Map approval.	
	Schools				
	Significant Effect: The Otay Ranch student population would generate the need for additional schools. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-4 thro				
262	The Applicant shall prepare and submit for the appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to the first SPA Plan, in close coordination with the affected school districts, a School Facilities Master Plan. The School Facilities Master Plan shall assure the availability of school service for the first development within Otay Ranch and shall provide a comprehensive framework for the provision of school service with implementation of the entire Otay Ranch development. The School Facilities Master Plan shall:  • Demonstrate that a maximum capacity of 650 elementary students, 1,500 middle school students and 2,500 high school students will be achieved at each new school proposed in conjunction with Otay Ranch, in accordance with school district standards.  • Identify the general locations of schools through the General Development Plan.  The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall not be approved unless the School Facilities Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-6).	The PFFP prepared for the Proposed Project calculates the students generated from the Proposed Project, analyzes available or needed school capacity within the school districts serving the Project Area and analyzes phasing and funding of school facilities. The Proposed Project includes a 9.7-acre elementary school site within the Village 14 core area.	
263	Prior to SPA Plan approval, the Applicant shall provide documentation confirming school site locations and school district approval of the locations within that SPA. This approval shall entail site location, size, and configuration of schools, with provisions for access and pedestrian safety to the satisfaction of the various school districts. Funding and phasing shall also be addressed and confirmed in accordance with school district procedures.	Applicable	Satisfied: Letter from CVESD.	The Applicant has coordinated with the CVESD and the district has approved the 9.7-acre school site as it relates to location, size and access.	
264	SPA Plans shall include a Public Facilities Financing and Phasing Plan.	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1).	The PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project	
265	Prior to SPA Plan approval, the Applicant shall provide documentation to the appropriate jurisdiction confirming school district satisfaction of facility funding to fully mitigate Otay Ranch student generation impacts to below a level of significance.	Applicable	Satisfied. Achieved through Regulatory Compliance. Per State law, to be address prior to issuance of Building Permits within the Proposed Project.	Satisfaction of this Measure to be a condition of approval - timing consistent with State Law.	
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Projects would generate the need for additional schools. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-49]				
266	Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of school facilities studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on schools. These studies shall include an analysis of the cumulative demand for school facilities as a result of existing, proposed and approved projects.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR.	EIR Section 3.1.6, Public Services, analyzed impacts to school facilities. A school site has been reserved in the Village 14 Core area and service availability letters have been provided by the districts serving the Proposed Project.	
267	Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project specific improvements and to construct, or contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study with respect to the cumulative demand for school facilities as a result of new development.	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-6).	Funding of school facilities addressed in PFFP.	

			Compliance	
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	Library Services			
	Significant Effect: Additional library facilities would be required to serve the Otay Ranch population. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-5]			
268	The Applicant shall prepare and submit for the appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to the first SPA Plan, a Library Master Plan in accordance with the standards of the applicable jurisdiction. (See, for example the City of Chula Vista's Municipal Code section 19.09.040 (D).) The Library Master Plan shall address site location, size, and funding mechanisms. The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall be approved unless the Library Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).		Satisfied: The County did not require a stand-alone Library Master Plan specific to the Project. Per the Facilities Implementation Plan, See Specific Plan and PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.1-6).	The Otay Ranch Facilities Implementation Plan included Libraries as an Otay Ranch Facility; the Specific Plan and the PFFP satisfy the requirements of the Facilities Implementation Plan. Consistent with the Otay Ranch Facility Implementation Plan, Library Facilities Chapter, the PFFP prepared for the Proposed Project analyzed County library services and Project-related impacts on County Library Services and determined that the Proposed Project can be adequately served through existing County library facilities and services. In addition, the Fiscal Impact Analysis prepared for the Proposed Project determined that the Proposed Project generates adequate revenue to fund County Library services through the payment of property taxes.
269	SPA Plans shall include a Public Facilities Financing and Phasing Plan.	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-6).	A PFFP has been prepared for the Proposed Project that analyzes the demand for and provision of library services necessary to serve the proposed Project.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Additional library facilities and books would be required. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 6-50]		•	
270	Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of library facilities studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts,	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix	The PFFP and EIR Section 3.1.6, Public Services,
i	to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on libraries. These studies shall		3.1.1-6).	analyzed the Proposed Project's impacts to libraries and
	include an analysis of the cumulative demand for library facilities as a result of existing, proposed, and approved projects.			determined impact would be less than significant.
271	Each Applicant shall be required to construct Project specific improvements and to construct, or contribute towards the cost of constructing, any regional facilities required by the study with respect to the cumulative demand for library facilities as a result of new development.	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-6).	The PFFP and EIR Section 3.1.6, Public Services, analyzed cumulative impacts to library services and determined the Project's impacts would be less than significant.
	Parks, Recreation and Open Space			, J
	Significant Effect: Otay Ranch would generate additional demand for regional and local parkland, open space, and recreational facilities.	[FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-5	5 through p. 4.9.14-6]	
272	Open space shall be provided in compliance with Policy Nos. 20 and 22 of the project's RMP, regarding permitted uses of the management preserve and the creation of a "Recreation Access Plan." The Recreation Access Plan shall address the following issues:  Establishing linkages between preserve trails and community and regional trails systems, including regional park trails.  Identifying trail access points to the management preserve consistent with resource protection goals.  Establishing appropriate daily and seasonal limits on trail use.  Assuring that the kind and intensity of trail uses is consistent with protection of resource areas being traversed  Within the RMP Management Preserve, permitted recreational uses shall be consistent with long-term protection and management of sensitive natural and manmade resources. A maximum of 400 acres within the preserve may be designated for active recreational purposes. A range of public access and regional recreational uses shall be provided; permitted recreational uses shall include the following, so long as they are designed in an environmentally-sensitive manner:  Walking and hiking trails  Limited wilderness-type camping and picnic facilities, equestrian trails, bicycle trails, link-style golf courses in non-sensitive area Native plant nursery and botanical garden	Applicable	Satisfied: The Otay Valley Regional Park (OVRP) Concept Plan, Phase 2 RMP Update and MSCP County Subarea Plan. Preserve Edge Plan prepared for the Proposed Project address access restrictions.	The Proposed Project is consistent with the OVRP Trails Plan, and County Trails Master Plan. The County is working with the City of Chula Vista, wildlife agencies and stakeholders on the Otay Regional Trails Alignment Study which will determine appropriate and feasible trail alignments within RMP/MSCP Preserve areas surrounding the Proposed Project.  The Otay Ranch RMP does not identify any active recreation uses within the Project Area.
273	The Project must provide 15 acres of regional park and open space per 1,000 Otay Ranch residents, a minim um of 3 acres of neighborhood and community park land per 1,000 Otay Ranch residents and 12 acres of other active or passive recreation and open space per 1,000 Otay Ranch residents	Applicable	Satisfied: Standards met in Specific Plan and project design.	The Otay Ranch GDP/SRP does not identify regional or community park facilities within the Project Area. The Proposed Project includes approximately 140 acres of regional open space in satisfaction of this requirement. The Proposed Project also includes over 24 acres of public and

274	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project		
274	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Droinet		
274		Floject	Method	Discussion
274				private neighborhood parks, in satisfaction of County Park Land Development Ordinance requirements.
	Recreational facilities and open space shall be provided in accordance with the General Development Plan (GDP)/Subregional Plan and the General Plan Amendments.	Applicable	Satisfied: Standards met in Specific Plan and project design.	The Proposed Project includes over 24 acres of public and private parks, nearly 140 acres of regional open space and 427 acres of on-site RMP Preserve Land and will convey 350 acres of off-site RMP Preserve Land to the POM
275	The Project SPA Plans shall further define the location, acreage, and boundaries of neighborhood and community parks and open space on the Otay Ranch property in a form and manner acceptable to the City of Chula Vista and the County of San Diego	Applicable	Satisfied: Specific Plan.	The Specific Plan provides conceptual public and private park plans, consistent with County requirements. The Specific Plan also identifies open space areas within the Development Footprint and the RMP Preserve.
276	The Applicant shall prepare and submit for appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to approval of the first SPA Plan in accordance with the required parkland acreage standards of the appropriate jurisdiction(s), a Recreation Access Master Plan. The Recreation Access Master Plan shall address facilities requirements, site-selection criteria and specific park site locations, and funding mechanisms, and provide a bicycle and trails plan developed by the Project Applicant in conjunction with the Parks, Recreation, and Open Space Master Plan for Otay Ranch.	Applicable	Satisfied: Specific Plan, Exhibit 6, Parks, Recreation, Open Space, RMP Preserve & Trails Plan and PFFP (EIR Appendix 3.1.6-1)	See Comment #272 above. The Specific Plan and PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) address finding mechanisms associated with the provision of park and trails within the Proposed Project. The Specific Plan identifies the locations of bicycle facilities within the Proposed Project. The Proposed Project is required to meet the County's Park Land Development Ordinance Requirement through the construction of on-site public and private park facilities.
277	The Master Plan shall be consistent with the GDP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall not be approved unless the Recreation Access Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).	Applicable	See #276 above	See Comments # 272 to 276 above.
278	All SPA Plans shall include a Public Facilities Financing and Phasing Plan.	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-6)	The PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.6-1) was prepared for the Proposed Project that analyzes the demand for provision of public parks in satisfaction of the County PLDO.
279	The funding source for local parks shall be the Park Lands Dedication Ordinance (PLDO), or similar exaction authority. Should the PLDO be satisfied through the payment of fees, the park improvements shall be made by the jurisdiction or park district. If the PLDO is satisfied by (and dedication, the Applicant shall provide turn-key facilities.	Applicable	Satisfied: PFFP (EIR, Appendix 3.1.1-6)	Park land requirements are met onsite through the provision of over 24 acres of public and private parks within the Proposed Project.
280	The reconstruction of the State Department of Recreation's California Riding and Hiking Trail shall be implemented along with the attendant roadway improvements. If necessary, easement relocation within Otay Ranch shall occur at the Applicant's expense.	Not Applicable		The State Department of Recreation's California Riding and Hiking Trail easements are located in the Otay Valley and San Ysidro Parcels.
	Significant Cumulative Effect: Additional regional and local park land, open space, and recreational facilities would be required to serve 2, p. 6-51]	the cumulative impact area. S	gnificant cumulative impacts would als	o occur to waterfowl hunting in the area. [FPEIR, Volume
281	Each Applicant shall prepare and obtain appropriate jurisdiction approval of the park, recreation, and open space studies and financing plans to identify specific impacts, to determine the significance of the effect, and to identify measures that would reduce or eliminate the effect on these services. The establishment of the management preserve through the RMP, construction of the various community and neighborhood parks, and installation of the regional bike, equestrian, and hiking trail network would serve the needs of Otay Ranch, and also provide for recreation opportunities for the entire region.	Applicable	Addressed in the Project-level EIR and technical studies and achieved through compliance with Conditions of Approval.	The Proposed Project complies with the County Park Land Dedication Ordinance by providing 24.7 acres of public and private parkland, 12.0-acres of which are eligible for PLDO credit, as well as over 425 acres of open space. The Proposed Project also includes a PFFP which identifies the timing and funding source of park construction and maintenance.
	Electricity and Gas			
	Significant Effect: Additional substations and associated distribution lines would be required to service the Project. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p			
282	The Project Applicant shall work with SDG&E during all stages of electrical and gas facilities planning to minimize disturbance to sensitive resources.	Applicable	Satisfied: Coordination conducted at Project-level.	An SDG&E Substation is planned in Village 10, not applicable to this Proposed Project. All utilities within the Proposed Project to be underground in Right of Way.
283	Land uses adjacent to the SDG&E transmission lines shall be subject to review and comment by SDG&E.	Applicable	Satisfied: Coordination conducted at Project-level.	The Draft EIR was circulated for a 45-day public review and no comments were received from SDG&E.

			Compliance	
		Applicable to Proposed		
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Project	Method	Discussion
	Health and Medical Services Facilities			
	Significant Effect: Otay Ranch would generate the need for additional health and medical service facilities. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-7]			
284	To ensure provision of and access to facilities which meet the health care needs of Otay Ranch residents, governmental agencies and development planners shall work directly with service providers to identify the need for and location of medical and health facilities in the Otay Ranch area during all stages of planning.	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Specific Plan, Regional Facilities Master Plan and Specific Plan Development Regulations.	The Proposed Project includes up to 10,000 sf of commercial/ retail/office use that would be appropriate for medical services offices
285	Prior to SPA Plan approval, siting and design criteria shall be developed by the Project Applicant, in conjunction with the appropriate governmental agencies, to address public and private health and medical care facilities. Criteria should include, but not be limited to, consideration for impact of facility concentration on neighborhoods, access to transportation, and co-location of comparable programs where feasible.	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Specific Plan, Development Regulations.	Per the Specific Plan, Chapter IV, Development Regulations, uses are permitted within the Mixed-Use area within the Proposed Project
	Senior and Social Service			
	Significant Effect: Otay Ranch would generate the need for additional senior and social service facilities. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-7 the			
286	To ensure provision of and access to facilities which meet the senior and social service needs of Otay Ranch residents, governmental agencies and development planners shall work directly with service providers to identify the need for and location of senior and social service facilities in the Otay Ranch area.	Applicable	Satisfied: Specific Plan, Regional Facilities Master Plan.	The Proposed Project includes up to 10,000 sf of commercial/ retail/office use that would be appropriate for senior services offices
287	Prior to approval, SPA Plans shall be circulated by the Project Applicant to the Commission on Aging, Department of Social Services, Area Agency on Aging, Human Services Council and Chula Vista 21 for their review and input.	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Project circulated for Public Review, per County/CEQA requirements.	Draft EIR and Specific Plan was circulated for 45-day public review, no comments received from listed agencies.
288	<ul> <li>Planning for social services for the residents of Otay Ranch shall incorporate the following considerations:</li> <li>The elderly has special needs for affordable housing, transportation, and health care. The number of persons 65 years of age and older requiring long-term care will continue to increase significantly, and as family size also decreases, there will be less family-based support and increased reliance on outside services for the elderly.</li> <li>The public sector and community-based organizations will need to deliver services in more culturally sensitive ways. Close collaboration with ethnic and cultural groups will be essential</li> </ul>	Not Applicable		The County does not have an inclusionary housing program; therefore, the Proposed Project does not include affordable housing.
	Child Care Facilities			
	Significant Effect: Otay Ranch would generate the need for additional child care facility space. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-8]			
289	Applicant shall prepare and submit for appropriate jurisdiction(s) approval prior to the first SPA Plan, a Child Care Master Plan. The Child Care Master Plan shall address site-selection criteria and acreage requirements based on the child-care demand of the Project. The Child Care Master Plan shall require that Child care and pre-school facility sites shall be located adjacent to public and private schools, religious assembly uses, village center employment areas, transit centers and other locations deemed appropriate. The Master Plan shall be consistent with the SRP and implement all applicable mitigation measures and/or conditions of prior approval(s). The SPA Plan shall not be approved unless the Child Care Master Plan is accepted/approved by the appropriate jurisdiction(s).	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Specific Plan, Regional Facilities Master Plan and Specific Plan Development Regulations.	Per the Specific Plan, Chapter IV, Development Regulations, family day care facilities are permitted within residential land uses. In addition, daycare/nursery school is a permitted use within the village core
	Animal Control Facilities			
	Significant Effect: Otay Ranch would generate the need for additional animal control facility space. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.14-9]			
290	The Project Applicant shall participate in programs to equitably share the funding of animal control facilities and designate animal control facilities sufficient to provide adequate square footage of shelter space per Otay Ranch dwelling unit to the satisfaction of the appropriate jurisdiction.	Applicable	<u>Satisfied:</u> Addressed through County requirements.	The Proposed Project would participate in any regional animal control program adopted by the County of San Diego and fund through the collection of property taxes and sales and use taxes.
	RISK OF UPSET			
	Significant Effect: Increase in urbanization would result in an increase in the use, transport, storage, and disposal of hazardous materials	and an associated increase i	n the risk of an upset condition in the a	rea. [FPEIR, Volume 2, p. 4.9.15-1]
291	Soil and ground-water testing shall occur in the ranch operations center area potentially affected by the previous disposal of hazardous waste or historic pesticide use. The purpose of the testing shall be to identify areas of contamination in excess of federal and state standards. Should areas of excess contamination be identified, remediation shall occur prior to residential development.	Not Applicable		The ranch operations center was located on the Otay Valley Parcel.
292	The Applicant shall notify prospective buyers and the California Department of Health Services (DHS), as required, regarding the Applicant's intention to develop the area adjacent to the Otay Landfill and the Appropriate Technologies II hazardous waste facilities.	Not Applicable		The Otay Landfill and the Appropriate Technologies II hazardous waste facilities are not located adjacent to the project.

**DUDEK** 

			Compliance	
	Mitigation Measure (Note – the project as defined in this column is the entire Otay Ranch)	Applicable to Proposed Project	Method	Discussion
293	The U.S. Army or another appropriate entity shall conduct a survey of the Brown Field Bombing Range to identify the presence of any unexploded ammunition. Should unexploded ordnance be located on the property, appropriate measures shall be taken for removal of the material.	Not Applicable		Applies to areas within the Otay Valley Parcel and does not apply to the Project Area.
294	The transport of hazardous waste by the Applicant, sub-contractors, and future businesses on existing and future roadways shall be conducted in accordance with the California Code of Regulations (CCR) and the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR). These regulations identify Department of Transportation (DOT) approved methods for packaging and containerizing hazardous waste and site appropriate options and procedures relative to the handling and transportation of these wastes.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR.	Addressed in EIR Section 3.1.1, Hazards and Hazardous Materials and determined to the less than significant impact. All transport would be subject to comply with applicable requirements for hazardous waste.
295	The need for emergency evacuation routes and other emergency facilities shall be determined at the Specific Plan level if necessary based on the presence of onsite industrial uses as well as the presence of offsite industrial uses.	Applicable	Satisfied: Addressed in the Project-level EIR.	No industrial uses are present on or off-site near the Project Area. A Wildland Fire Evacuation Plan (WFEP) was prepared for potential fire evacuation.

TERMS USED IN THIS DOCUMENT

The following terms are utilized within the Otay Ranch Program EIR Mitigation Measures:

Project/Otay Ranch Project –23,000-acre Otay Ranch

Otay Ranch GDP/SRP - Otay Ranch General Development Plan (GDP)/Otay Subregional Plan (SRP), Volume 2

Resource Management Plan – Otay Ranch Resource Management Plan (RMP)

Multiple Species Conservation Plan (MSCP) - MSCP County Subarea Plan

Preserve - RMP Preserve

The following terms are utilized in the "Method of Compliance" and "Comments" columns:

Proposed Project/Project Area/Project Site -Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Specific Plan

Preserve – Otay Ranch Resource Management Plan (RMP) Preserve

Specific Plan – Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Specific Plan

Preserve Edge Plan –Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Preserve Edge Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 1)

Fire Protection Plan –Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Fire Protection Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 2)

Energy Conservation Plan – Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Energy Conservation Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 3)

Public Facilities Finance Plan – Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Public Facilities Finance Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 4)

Village Design Plan – Village Design Plan, Otay Ranch Village 14 (Specific Plan, Appendix 5)

Water Conservation Plan - Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Water Conservation Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 6)

Design Guidelines – Otay Ranch Planning Areas 16/19 Design Guidelines (Specific Plan, Appendix 7)

Agriculture Plan – Otay Ranch Planning Areas 16/19 Agricultural Plan (Specific Plan, Appendix 8)

Tentative Map – Otay Ranch Village 14 and Planning Areas 16/19 Tentative Map 5616



INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK